

ARIZONA INDEPENDENT REDISTRICTING COMMISSION

Tuesday, October 25, 2011
6:12 p.m.

Location

**Buena Performing Arts Center
Buena High School
5225 Buena School Boulevard
Sierra Vista, Arizona 85635**

Attending

Linda C. McNulty, Commissioner
Richard P. Stertz, Commissioner

Buck Forst, Information Technology Specialist
Kristina Gomez, Deputy Executive Director

Joe Kanefield, Legal Counsel

Reported By:
Marty Herder, CCR
Certified Court Reporter #50162

Sierra Vista, Arizona
October 25, 2011
6:12 p.m.

P R O C E E D I N G S

(Whereupon, the public session commences.)

COMMISSIONER McNULTY: This hearing of the Arizona Independent Redistricting Commission will come to order.

It is Wednesday, October 25th, at 6:12 p.m.

We're at the Buena Vista High School performing arts auditorium.

And we thank the city of Sierra Vista and the high school for welcoming us.

Let's begin by rising to say the Pledge of Allegiance.

(Whereupon, the Pledge of Allegiance was recited.)

COMMISSIONER McNULTY: Thank you all for coming this evening to give us your input about the draft congressional and legislative maps.

I'm Linda McNulty, a commissioner on the Arizona Independent Redistricting Commission.

I believe that Commissioner Richard Stertz is also going to join us, but he isn't here yet.

We have three other commissioners who will be

1 watching the live stream this evening, Chairperson Colleen
2 Mathis, Vice-Chair Jose Herrera, and Vice-Chair Scott
3 Freeman.

4 Typically we begin the hearings with offering the
5 services of a translator, which is required by the Voting
6 Rights Act. Our translator has not yet arrived either. So
7 I'm going to get started. But if the translator does
8 arrive, we may interrupt the proceedings so that the
9 translator is able to offer his or her services to anyone
10 who might need them.

11 You're going to need to bear with me because with
12 the bright lights in my eyes I can barely read, so I'm going
13 to use this little flashlight to make sure I cover
14 everything that I need to cover.

15 Our attorney, Joe Kanefield, from the law firm of
16 Ballard & Spahr, will be joining us in about 15 minutes.

17 Our deputy executive director, Kristina Gomez, is
18 here with us tonight.

19 Kristina, if you're in the back, if you could
20 please wave?

21 From our mapping consultant, Strategic Telemetry,
22 we have Korinne Belock with us tonight.

23 We have our court reporter, Marty Herder, who will
24 be transcribing the entire hearing.

25 And we have outreach workers, Shane Shields and

1 Karen Herrman, who are in the back of the room on the left
2 by the table there.

3 In the very back of the room is our chief
4 technology officer, Buck Forst, who arranges all our audio,
5 video, and our live stream.

6 As I said, we are live streaming this hearing now
7 so that folks can watch it on our website.

8 There are request to speak forms, yellow request
9 to speak forms which you would have seen as you came in.

10 If you would like to speak this evening, please
11 fill one of these out and provide it one of the staff
12 members at the table and they will bring them up to me.

13 There is also an information packet that I hope
14 you received as you came in. If not, there are more on the
15 table in the back. And they provide a lot of information
16 about the redistricting process, where we are in the
17 process, and copies of the draft maps.

18 There's also at the back of that form a blue
19 public input form. If you're here tonight just to listen
20 and you'd like to provide written comments rather than
21 speaking, you're welcome to fill out that blue form, and you
22 can leave it at the desk, you can mail it to us, or you can
23 submit your input on our website. And we'll give you the
24 website address in a couple minutes here when we do our
25 presentation.

1 Korinne is going to give you on the screen here an
2 overview of the redistricting process, how it came to be,
3 what it is that we're supposed to accomplish, and where we
4 are in the process.

5 So with that I think I'll turn it over to Korinne
6 Belock.

7 KORINNE KUBENA BELOCK: Good evening.

8 I am Korrine Kubena Belock from Strategic
9 Telemetry. I'm happy to be here this evening in
10 Sierra Vista to discuss the draft congressional and
11 legislative maps presented by the Arizona Independent
12 Redistricting Commission.

13 The goal of these meetings is to hear comments
14 from you about the maps that have been drafted.

15 So thank you for taking the time to attend this
16 evening.

17 The draft maps you see today -- that you will see
18 today are currently under a 30-day review period so that the
19 Commission can hear your opinion about these maps.

20 So before I get into the maps, I just want to give
21 you a quick overview of the redistricting process.

22 So Arizona's redistricting process is governed by
23 the state constitution as amended by voters in 2000 with the
24 passage of Proposition 106.

25 It stipulates that Arizona's Independent

1 Redistricting Commission redraw congressional and
2 legislative districts to reflect the results of the most
3 recent census. So due to the 2010 census, Arizona gained a
4 congressional seat going from eight to nine seats.

5 So going through the requirements of the state
6 constitution via Prop 106, the new district boundaries must
7 comply with the U.S. Constitution and the Voting Rights Act.
8 They must have equal population.

9 And criteria A and B are federally mandated.

10 And then to the extent practicable, the districts
11 must be compact and contiguous, respect communities of
12 interest, use visible geographic features, city, town, and
13 county boundaries, and undivided census tracts, and favor
14 competitive districts where no significant detriment to
15 other goals.

16 So moving on to a bit about the Voting Rights Act
17 before we get into the maps.

18 So Arizona's congressional and legislative
19 districts must receive preclearance from the -- or approval
20 from the Department of Justice or a federal court under
21 Section 5 of the Voting Rights Act before they can take
22 effect.

23 To get preclearance, Arizona must demonstrate that
24 the new districts do not discriminate against minority
25 voters in purpose or effect, which means there can be no

1 accidental or intentional discrimination.

2 Under Section 5 Arizona's redistricting plans
3 cannot be retrogressive. The plans cannot weaken or reduce
4 minority voters' rights.

5 And the presence of discrimination can be
6 determined by analyzing population data and election
7 results.

8 So before we go to the timeline of the Commission,
9 we have a brief video from Bruce Adelson who has been
10 advising the Commission on matters of the Voting Rights Act.

11 (Whereupon, a video presentation of Bruce Adelson
12 was shown.)

13 KORINNE KUBENA BELOCK: So, going back to the
14 slides now. Overall timeline for the redistricting process
15 can be broken down into five steps, which we'll run through
16 now.

17 Earlier this year, step one, the Commission was
18 established.

19 The commissioners were appointed following a
20 thorough screening process and serve in a voluntary role for
21 the state of Arizona.

22 Of course tonight we have with us
23 Commissioner Linda McNulty, and the other commissions not
24 present are listed on the screen here which Ms. McNulty
25 already covered.

1 Now, going into step two with the first round of
2 hearings.

3 Before drawing a single line on the maps you'll
4 see this evening, the Commission held 23 public hearings
5 around the state in July and August to get input from
6 members of the public on issues about redistricting.

7 Comments range from anything about geography,
8 communities of interest, minority voting rights, and
9 competitiveness.

10 Then the mapping process actually began.

11 Per Proposition 106, the Commission was required
12 for start with a blank slate, which we'll talk about a
13 little bit more.

14 They then divided the state into equal population
15 in compact, grid-like districts. And the grid map was
16 approved on August 18th.

17 Since adopting the grid map, the Commission has
18 met more than 25 times to consider adjustments, adjustments
19 based on the state constitutional criteria. And during this
20 time they also received additional public input and comment
21 as well as draft maps from the public.

22 Approval of the draft maps happened shortly
23 thereafter. On October 23rd -- I'm sorry, October 3rd, the
24 Commission approved draft congressional map, and that
25 incorporated changes based on the constitutional criteria.

1 They then approved a draft legislative map on
2 October 10th.

3 Which brings us to the second round of public
4 hearings.

5 We're currently visiting 25 towns and cities to
6 share the draft maps and to receive addition input during
7 the months of October and November.

8 The next step after the second round of hearings
9 will be final maps.

10 Upon completion of a public comment period, the
11 AIRC will adopt final maps.

12 And then step six, preclearance, which Bruce
13 Adelson touched upon.

14 Again, because Arizona is subject to Section 5 of
15 the Voting Rights Act, the district maps must be approved by
16 the federal Department of Justice or the federal court in
17 Washington, D.C., before they can be used for Arizona law --
18 Arizona elections.

19 So now moving into the maps.

20 So to show you the process of how the draft maps
21 were constructed, we're going to show you the progression of
22 the maps.

23 So the map you see here on the screen is the
24 congressional map that was approved by the last Commission
25 and was most recently used in the 2010 election.

1 Moving into the blank slate map.

2 So per Proposition 106, the Commission was
3 required to start with a blank slate, not taking into
4 consideration any previous election districts or incumbents.

5 They then moved into the grid maps, which is also
6 a requirement of Proposition 106. However, the grid map
7 only took into consideration two of the six constitutional
8 criteria: Equal population and compactness.

9 So then in August the Commission asked that
10 two grid maps be drafted. And on August 18th they agreed on
11 option two, which is the version that you see here.

12 So then working from the grid map, after more than
13 25 meetings, the Commission voted to approve the draft map
14 that you now see on the screen.

15 In addition to taking into consideration the
16 six constitutional criteria, the Commission took into
17 consideration public comments that they received at
18 meetings, at hearings, comments that were mailed, e-mailed,
19 faxed, called into the Commission. Basically any means of
20 getting in comments, the Commission was able to receive
21 those.

22 And then, just so you know, over 5,000 comments
23 helped develop the draft map that you see today.

24 So just to go through some of the highlights of
25 this draft map with you.

1 The draft congressional map includes two districts
2 that are predominantly rural, three border districts, three
3 districts in the greater Tucson region, five districts that
4 are entirely in Maricopa County. The map avoids splitting
5 Arizona's Indian reservations, and it creates two districts
6 where minority voters have an opportunity to elect a
7 candidate of choice.

8 So now moving into the legislative maps.

9 Much like the congressional draft map, the process
10 followed a very -- the same process was followed.

11 Here you see the legislative map on the screen
12 from the last Commission, which, again, was most recently
13 used in 2010 elections.

14 Then, again, per Proposition 106, the Commission
15 started with a blank slate map.

16 And then a grid map was approved in August.

17 Similar to the congressional map, the grid map
18 only took into consideration equal population and
19 compactness.

20 Which leads us up to the draft legislative map.

21 Arizona has 30 legislative districts, and each
22 district elects one senator and two house members.

23 To go through some of the highlights of the
24 legislative map with you, the Commission took into
25 consideration population growth and reduction.

1 So in the old districts population ranged from
2 about 155,000 to 378,000.

3 Now with the current draft, the population ranges
4 from 207,000 to 215,000.

5 Again, to comply with the Voting Rights Act, the
6 plan also includes ten districts in which minority voters
7 should have an opportunity to elect the candidate of choice.

8 And the draft you see creates three districts
9 wholly within Pima County and three additional southern
10 Arizona districts. It creates 17 districts that are
11 primarily within Maricopa County, and includes nine
12 districts that are primarily rural.

13 So, again, the most important reason we're here is
14 to hear your input.

15 So we definitely want to hear what you have to say
16 about these draft maps.

17 There are many ways that your voice can be heard,
18 of course.

19 You can fill out a request to speak form at a
20 public hearing and provide the Commission with your input.

21 Examples of input might include your thoughts on
22 any of the constitutional criteria or specific
23 recommendations for the congressional or legislative maps.
24 You can also submit your input by speaking at a hearing,
25 filling out a public input form at a hearing or on the AIRC

1 website.

2 And just to highlight the website, it's
3 azredistricting.org.

4 You can also call the Commission with any input
5 you have at (602)542-5221, or toll free at (855)733-7478.

6 So another important part of this process is to
7 make sure that you can stay connected throughout the
8 process.

9 So what you see now on the screen is a screen shot
10 of the Commission's website. And the arrows highlight a few
11 key areas that I want to point out for you.

12 Under meetings you can watch future or past
13 meetings. If you're interested in any of the deliberation
14 that went into forming the draft maps, you can watch the
15 previous date -- videos listed by previous date and find
16 what you need.

17 If you'd like to make comments, you can go to the
18 public input form link, which is highlighted as well.

19 Or if you'd like to view the maps, which I'm sure
20 you will, you can click on maps. There's two ways to access
21 them on the website, which you see highlighted here at the
22 top and the bottom.

23 Tonight to talk about the link at the bottom, this
24 will take you directly to the draft maps.

25 And if you click on that link, the screen that you

1 see now is the screen that it's going to pull up for you.

2 What you basically see here is a listing of the
3 draft maps saved in various different file types, JPEG, PDF,
4 and tonight we're going to talk about the Google maps/KMZ
5 file, because that's a great way to view the maps.

6 So once you click on the link here that's
7 highlighted that says KMZ/Google, you will be taken to the
8 next screen, which you'll see here, which is a viewing of
9 the Google map.

10 So most people, of course, are interested in
11 viewing the draft maps.

12 So once you click on the map, basically this is
13 the version you'll see for the Google map.

14 The great thing about this version is that you're
15 able to zoom in and out down to specific boundaries of your
16 district to see exactly where those lines have been drawn.

17 What you see on the screen now is a draft
18 congressional map zoomed out from the entire state.

19 On the left side of the screen, just to highlight
20 that for you, that's a bar which contains a series of
21 different filters, county tags, tags for different
22 population counts, tags for colors of the map. So if you
23 unclick on some of those check boxes for areas you're not
24 interested in viewing, you'll be able to better view the map
25 specifically for what you're looking for. I just wanted to

1 highlight that for you.

2 So as you zoom into the map, the next slide shows
3 you a view of what that looks like.

4 So this slide shows you zoomed in look on some of
5 the districts surrounding Maricopa County.

6 Again, you have the ability to zoom in and out on
7 the map down to specific boundaries, specific streets, and
8 blocks that you want to take a look at.

9 So it's a really great way to access and view the
10 maps.

11 So as I wrap this up, I just want to highlight
12 that the Commission's website, again, is
13 azredistricting.org. On the website you can draw maps, you
14 can watch meetings, and you can also find out about future
15 meetings that have been scheduled.

16 I also want to encourage you to follow the
17 Commission on Twitter, if you're into social media at the
18 hash tag AIRC. And you can also friend the Commission on
19 Facebook for up-to-the-minute updates. It's a good way to
20 stay connected.

21 So, again, you know, as I wrap this up, I just
22 want to thank you for coming out tonight to be a part of the
23 process.

24 A final point on these maps is copies can be found
25 in your packet tonight that you received. And we also have

1 the poster sized versions in the back of the room which you
2 might have seen as well, which are a great way to view the
3 maps.

4 And I want to point out that I'm absolutely
5 available after the public comment period to answer any
6 questions you might have about the mapping process or about
7 the maps in particular. I'm happy to speak with you. And
8 you can also grab any staff as well who will be able to
9 answer questions about how to access the maps or anything
10 along those lines.

11 So, again, I look forward to speaking with you
12 this evening, and thank you for having us here.

13 (Whereupon, Commission Stertz joins the meeting.)

14 COMMISSIONER McNULTY: Thank you, Korinne.

15 As you can see, Commissioner Stertz has joined us
16 after a long trip from Tucson.

17 This is, as you, as you see in your packet, we've
18 had a number of hearings. This is the 17th tonight of
19 29 scheduled hearings. And we don't all attend all of them.
20 So we share the responsibility, and tonight it's
21 Commissioner Stertz and I.

22 Tomorrow night, just for your information, the
23 hearing will be in Mesa, the next night in Safford, and then
24 with a simultaneous videocast in Clifton, Morenci. The next
25 night in Nogales, and then Saturday in Yuma.

1 We have Sunday off, and then we have another
2 series of hearings next week.

3 I'll remind you once again that if you would like
4 to speak tonight, please fill out a yellow request to speak
5 form, and our staff will bring it up here to us.

6 I have about 50 of them right now, so I'm going to
7 ask that we limit our comments to two minutes.

8 Buck Forst in the back has a timer to remind
9 everyone.

10 I think you'll be able to hear it when your
11 two minutes is. At the end please wrap it up so that we can
12 give everybody an opportunity speak.

13 Last night we had a number of people in Tucson,
14 and it went so long, so long that some people got worn out
15 and went home.

16 So, we really do want everyone to have a chance to
17 speak.

18 If you have more to stay than two minutes, we'll
19 allow it. Please feel free to fill out the blue forms. You
20 can also submit comments on our website, and our staff can
21 help you if you have questions about how to do that.

22 (Whereupon, Joseph Kanefield joins the meeting.)

23 COMMISSIONER McNULTY: Everything that you say
24 tonight will be transcribed and will become part of the
25 official record.

1 If you have documents to submit or proposed map
2 revisions or suggestions about things that can be tweaked on
3 the map, you can give those to the staff, and they will
4 become part of our official record. They can also submitted
5 electronically. And, again, the staff can help you if you
6 have questions about how to do that.

7 As, as we said, the reason that we're here tonight
8 is to receive your comments on the draft maps. It's quite a
9 challenge to blend together the six constitutional criteria
10 to put these maps together.

11 We spent a lot of time on them, but we understand
12 that you will have comments both about ways in which they --
13 you think they achieve your objectives perhaps and ways in
14 which they don't, in ways in which you would like to see
15 them changed or improved.

16 To the extent that you can be specific, give us
17 specific comments about those things. That would be
18 helpful. And keeping in mind that every time we change --
19 make one change on the map, it requires that you make other
20 changes, of course, to all the other districts.

21 So if you thought in considering your changes you
22 would like how it would affect other districts and what we
23 might do to compensate for them, those kind of comments are
24 very helpful also.

25 Okay. With that, just a few reminders. When you

1 come up to the microphone, please speak directly into it,
2 which is what I'm trying to do now.

3 Buck or Shane, is there going to be someone in the
4 front of the room who can help adjust the microphone if
5 folks need them to?

6 We'll see if someone can work on that. Sometimes
7 it takes a little work to get it right in the right place.

8 Please give your name and spell it, your last
9 name, or both names if they're unusual, so Mr. Herder can
10 take an accurate record.

11 If you're going to be talking with us about
12 neighborhoods or particular places that may have unusual
13 spellings, if you could please spell those also for
14 Mr. Herder.

15 Please specify the city or town that you're from.
16 We don't need your address, but we'd like to know the area
17 that you live in.

18 If you have any materials that you would like to
19 make part of the record, please give it to the staff.

20 Okay. With that, we have a member of the board of
21 the supervisors and a couple city council folks here, so I'm
22 going to call on them first.

23 And then after that I'll probably call three folks
24 at a time so that you can collect your thoughts and be ready
25 to come up when it's your turn.

1 And the first speaker will be Ann English,
2 Supervisor for the Cochise County Board of Supervisors.

3 (Applause.)

4 SUPERVISOR ANN ENGLISH: Thank you,
5 Commissioners McNulty and Stertz, for being here.

6 I indicated when we had the first meeting that I
7 would hope that you would give us some consideration for
8 compactness and keep Cochise County as a whole but I would
9 wait to see what the maps looked like.

10 And now that we have seen them, I'm here to ask
11 you to make some changes.

12 We've worked very hard in Cochise County to try to
13 develop a total community of interest in our county with a
14 plan.

15 So the Cochise County Board of Supervisors -- and
16 by the way my name is Ann English, A-N-N, E-N-G-L-I-S-H,
17 just like the language.

18 The Cochise County Board of Supervisors strongly
19 objects to the proposed congressional map and the proposed
20 legislative map drawn by the Arizona Independent
21 Redistricting Commission.

22 The Board of Supervisors strongly urges the
23 Commission to redraw each of these maps by placing
24 Cochise County entirely in one single congressional district
25 and a single legislative district.

1 There are only 130,000 people in Cochise County.

2 And so there is a lot of border that you could use
3 all of Cochise County as part of the -- one of the
4 congressional districts, still have plenty of border that
5 you could divide it into two other congressional districts,
6 if your total mission is to have three districts along the
7 border.

8 We don't feel that the 7,000 people that you've
9 picked out of Cochise County running from Bowie, San Simon
10 down and picking up my little community of McNeal in the
11 Chiricahua Mountains, that's 7,000 people, that you've added
12 to a district that's 500 miles long.

13 We don't think that represents -- what you want to
14 do is to have a congressional person that you can contact
15 when you have problems.

16 It isn't just what they're voting on in congress.
17 It's all of the day-to-day problems that the congressional
18 people have to listen to. And so it's very important to
19 have people close by that you can contact about veterans
20 affairs issues and those kinds of problems.

21 If you do insist that you can only use these maps,
22 we at the county level have 20 precincts that you have
23 changed.

24 We have to change all of our precincts so that
25 they match with yours.

1 Some of your precincts or some of your boundaries
2 don't match either, so I have, I have given some maps here
3 that shows you if you give a little bit of tinkering with
4 those, we can live with that more.

5 Our ultimate goal is to keep Cochise County whole.
6 But if we can't, then I have some maps to give here. And I
7 have the address of our GIS coordinator that you could,
8 could -- I'm sure you have lots of information too, but
9 these maps will give you an idea of exactly what we're after
10 here in Cochise County.

11 And we think that it's very important that you
12 consider the community of interest and Cochise County is a
13 whole community of interest.

14 We think that county boundaries are important, and
15 we ask that you honor those.

16 Could I give these to you?

17 (Applause.)

18 COMMISSIONER McNULTY: Thank you,
19 Supervisor English.

20 Our next speaker will be Tom Crosby a member of
21 the Sierra Vista City Council.

22 And while Mr. Crosby comes up, I will tell
23 Mr. Kanefield that I already introduced him in his absence,
24 but this is our legal counsel, Joe Kanefield.

25 (Applause.)

1 COUNCILMAN TOM CROSBY: Tom Crosby, Sierra Vista
2 City Council.

3 Basically this is how we'd like our district maps
4 drawn. For the legislative districts the border on the
5 south, the Santa Rita Mountains to the west, the New Mexico
6 state line to the east, Graham and Greenlee Counties to the
7 north.

8 For the congressional district -- the first one I
9 said was the legislative district, excuse me.

10 For the congressional district, the border to the
11 south, the New Mexico state line to the east, Graham and
12 Greenlee Counties to the north, the east half of Santa Cruz
13 County east of Highway 83, and the east portion of
14 Pima County.

15 I consider the residents of this county to be my
16 neighbors.

17 I'm very familiar with the challenges of the
18 border, both from a crime standpoint and more recently from
19 the border-related fires.

20 I found it interesting that the speaker in the
21 video touted his credibility as a former federal law
22 enforcement officer, because so am I.

23 So when I saw the proposed LD 2, it immediately
24 struck me as a map of the busiest smuggling routes for
25 illegally aliens and dope in the country.

1 In view of the minority-majority requirements that
2 the speaker in the video spoke of, I found that an
3 interesting coincidence.

4 I don't want the northern regions of
5 Legislative District 2 to become the de facto U.S.-Mexican
6 border.

7 Thank you very much.

8 (Applause.)

9 COMMISSIONER McNULTY: Thank you, Mr. Crosby.

10 Our next speaker I believe is Lerry Alderman from
11 the Globe City Council.

12 COUNCILMAN LERRY ALDERMAN: Commissioners, I thank
13 you for the opportunity to speak. I spoke to you,
14 Commissioner Stertz, at Globe on Friday. I was a little
15 disturbed as your closing remarks were that our paper didn't
16 match Flagstaff.

17 I'm also opposed to the legislative map and the
18 congressional map you have.

19 We have submitted formally a map of our latest
20 congressional map. I'll leave that with you.

21 I -- my main focus here is to share with you what
22 we are as a government.

23 I'm on the lowest rung of that political process.
24 Grass roots.

25 I serve approximately 1200 people in my district.

1 And each council person serves the same amount.

2 I suggest to you that the amount of paper and the
3 quality of paper are two different things.

4 The quality of the resolutions that the cities of
5 the rural eastern coalition have sent you folks represent
6 numbers, numbers of people that we represent. If we had
7 everyone here that we represent, this house would be full.

8 So, therefore, we represent our constituency.

9 It's important that you folks realize that. We
10 have a total of 750 -- or 7532 people that we represent in
11 that resolution that we sent to you.

12 Miami has 1,837.

13 Superior, 3,158.

14 Winkleman, 353.

15 Duncan, 696.

16 Hayden, 662.

17 Show Low, 10,660.

18 Eager, 4,885.

19 Springerville, 1,961.

20 Pinetop-Lakeside has 4,282.

21 And those are the ten that have submitted
22 resolutions to you folks.

23 I implore you that you look at that as numbers.

24 This is -- the folks that I represent are like me.
25 They're on a fixed income. And a lot of folks cannot make

1 the meetings. There are a lot of folks who are infirm.
2 There are folks who are without jobs that can't attend, so
3 we do that for them.

4 We represent them.

5 There are going to be five other communities
6 that are going to send resolutions to you folks, and they
7 have numbers as well. It's really easy to pull those
8 numbers up.

9 Our maps, they are -- have community interest,
10 mining, cattle, ranching, trees, timber, and, so, that's
11 what rural Arizona's about.

12 And I would just like to submit these to you and
13 ask you to really consider the numbers behind those, those
14 resolutions.

15 I thank you for the opportunity to speak.

16 God bless you.

17 COMMISSIONER McNULTY: Thank you,
18 Councilman Alderman.

19 (Applause.)

20 COMMISSIONER McNULTY: Okay. Our next speaker
21 will be Caitlyn Kramer from Douglas, followed by Susan Ann
22 Kramer, Michael Gomez, and Kathleen Gomez.

23 CAITLYN KRAMER: Thank you, Madam Chair and
24 commissioners.

25 First I would like to thank you for your efforts

1 in this task.

2 My name is Caitlyn Kramer, K-R-A-M-E-R. I am
3 13 years old, and I have lived in Douglas all my life. I
4 attend 8th grade at Paul Huber Middle School. In five years
5 I will be registering to vote. The maps you are creating
6 now will affect me at this time.

7 I ask that you reconsider both the legislative and
8 congressional maps in order to keep Cochise County in the
9 same district.

10 By splitting our country into more, more -- into
11 more than one district, you will be hurting our chances of
12 economic growth that we really need.

13 It would pit cities in Cochise County against each
14 other for state or for federal moneys and programs like
15 schools, colleges, and hospitals that would help our county.

16 It may be hard to get a legislator from another
17 area to fight for us.

18 As one county, we know the needs of our neighbors.
19 In our county we can work together to bring resources here.

20 The redistricting maps will place us with
21 communities that we have nothing in common with and separate
22 from the communities that we do share common interests with.

23 Because we are just about as far from the state
24 capital as possible, it is important that we keep our county
25 intact so that we can work together for improved services in

1 Cochise County.

2 I urge you to make these changes in these maps
3 since they will affect Cochise County for the next
4 ten years.

5 Thank you.

6 (Applause.)

7 COMMISSIONER McNULTY: Thank you.

8 Our next speaker is Susan Ann Kramer, from
9 Douglas.

10 SUSAN ANN KRAMER: Good evening, Madam Chair and
11 commissioners.

12 Let me first commend you for your efforts in the
13 task you have undertaken.

14 My name is Susan Ann Kramer, K-R-A-M-E-R. I have
15 lived in Douglas since 1981.

16 I taught middle school at Ray Borane Middle School
17 for 26 years and now own my own interior decorating
18 business.

19 I am the vice president of the Douglas
20 International Rotary Club. I sit on the board of the
21 Greater Chamber -- Greater Douglas Chamber of Commerce, as
22 well as the Douglas Unified School District board of
23 education.

24 I'm also a member of the Sierra Vista Chamber of
25 Commerce.

1 I would like to ask you to reconsider the
2 legislative and congressional maps in order to keep Cochise
3 County whole.

4 With the new maps there will be no community of
5 interest.

6 Throughout Cochise County we work together to
7 promote and support community events in our neighboring
8 towns.

9 We support nearby communities in times of tragedy,
10 most recently the fires in both Portal to the east and down
11 here in Hereford near Sierra Vista, as well as the Wilcox
12 school fire of a year ago.

13 It is more likely for the surrounding areas to
14 seek aid in these instances or things like this than it
15 would be for someone in Yuma or Flagstaff to want to help
16 us.

17 Support for state and federal funding
18 possibilities will be reduced for our community by this new
19 map because we'll be pitted against one another.

20 Communities in the same county will be competing
21 with each other for the same very often limited moneys. We
22 need to make sure that our county remains in the same
23 legislative and congressional districts for the next
24 ten years.

25 I urge you to reconsider the redistricting maps

1 and to keep our county together.

2 Thank you for allowing me to speak.

3 (Applause.)

4 COMMISSIONER McNULTY: Thank you, Ms. Kramer.

5 Our next speaker is Michael Gomez, from Douglas.

6 MAYOR DR. MICHAEL GOMEZ: Good afternoon,
7 Madam Chairman and commissioners. My name is Dr. Michael
8 Gomez.

9 I'm not a politician, but I am the mayor of the
10 city of Douglas. And I certainly will try hard.

11 It's taken us years to develop this community
12 interest in Cochise County amongst the mayors.

13 We meet every month, and we talk to each other,
14 and we try to solve our problems, and we discuss what we are
15 doing for our towns and everything.

16 But, what makes Arizona great. The cities.

17 Not the legislature, not anybody else.

18 The cities make Arizona great.

19 And the problem is that the border cities are the
20 ones that have a unique situation, because they have to keep
21 those legal -- that legal trade coming in from Sonora. They
22 spend \$7.2 million a day from Sonora legally in Arizona.

23 So do you think that by including a three -- three
24 districts it's going to help?

25 I can tell you that whoever lives in Flagstaff is

1 not going to be interested in border cities or border areas
2 or border issues.

3 Because they won't have time for it.

4 The mayors of the Arizona border, we have a border
5 mayors coalition, and we talk to each other weekly, and we
6 solve our problems that we share. Not only that, not too
7 long ago we formed a border mayors association in El Paso of
8 the entire border of Mexico.

9 So what you have done is split our community,
10 because those cities in Cochise supported border issues.
11 When I asked them to support the port of entry in Douglas,
12 it was unanimous. Without a doubt, they supported our
13 border issues.

14 So what has happened is I guess now that you have
15 split us, I guess Bisbee and Douglas are only going to be
16 the two mayors that have border mayors, or Cochise County
17 meeting, because everybody else is gone.

18 They might have different agendas.

19 But I can tell you, will the congressional person,
20 whoever it is from Flagstaff, come to the Arizona border
21 commission meetings?

22 Will he come to the border mayors meetings?

23 Will he come to all those meetings that we have
24 border issues?

25 I don't think so.

1 You should consider keeping Cochise County whole.

2 Thank you.

3 (Applause.)

4 COMMISSIONER McNULTY: Thank you, Mayor.

5 Our next speaker is Kathleen Gomez, and she will
6 be followed by Council Member Gwen Calhoun, Margaret
7 Stephens, and Jeri Ligon.

8 KATHLEEN GOMEZ: I also have my son, Diego Vlasic,
9 that had the sign form that was in Spanish because you
10 didn't have the ones that were in English, so I'm hoping
11 that maybe you can adjust it so they can speak too.

12 My name is Kathleen Gomez, and I'm from Douglas,
13 Arizona.

14 I want to thank you for your hard work, but I come
15 before you as a third generation born and raised in Douglas.

16 I am president of the Douglas Rotary, the vice
17 president of the Greater Douglas Chamber of Commerce, and
18 member of the Douglas Centennial Committee.

19 And I'll tell you working on the Centennial
20 Committee, we all got together in Cochise County to bring
21 our history together.

22 That history is what makes us whole.

23 And it was amazing in that history what we shared
24 together.

25 I also work for the Southeast Arizona Medical

1 Center, which was once the Cochise County Hospital, and is
2 101 years old. I'm their marketing and PR person.

3 We all know that it is difficult to work within
4 the guidelines that have been set about upon you.

5 Population, competitiveness, and the Voting Rights
6 Act are crucial in drawing the lines for the districts.

7 But these goals, in my opinion, have worked
8 against Cochise County. And when I think of the most
9 important of all, is true representation of the citizens of
10 Arizona, and especially Cochise County.

11 Cochise County is very diverse and has learned to
12 work together for the economic and cultural well-being of
13 our community. The chambers of commerce in Cochise County
14 have done something that no one else has done. We have
15 formed the Southeast Arizona Rural Chamber of Commerces.

16 This plan that splits the county in half is going
17 to impact our efforts greatly in what we are able to do in
18 Phoenix and in D.C. You know, the saying is, as Maricopa
19 goes, so does the state, and rural Arizona's concern down
20 the drain.

21 And that's exactly what I feel has happened here.

22 The ranching community has been the foundation of
23 Douglas. The ranchers filled our banks and with the
24 foundation of creating our community. They now are part of
25 a congressional district that encompasses half the state

1 puts them in Flagstaff.

2 For Douglas and Bisbee, you've taken us out of
3 Cochise County as far as our congressional concerns.

4 We may be a Mexican community. We may be Nogales,
5 Douglas, and south Tucson, but we are very, very different.

6 You know, in many ways you hear a lot of words.
7 And I was trying to think about how I could show you how
8 passionate we are in Cochise County about what has happened.
9 And all I can think of is a visual example.

10 If this is a congressional district, you split
11 Cochise County in half.

12 If this represents Cochise County legislatively,
13 you've taken Douglas and Bisbee and you've divided us.

14 You've divided a community that was once created
15 together into pieces.

16 Thank you.

17 (Applause.)

18 COMMISSIONER McNULTY: Thank you, Ms. Gomez.

19 Our next speaker is City Council Member Gwen
20 Calhoun.

21 COUNCILWOMAN GWEN CALHOUN: Good evening.

22 I have to say that I agree with most of the
23 speakers who spoken tonight about Cochise County.

24 We are indeed passionate about how we feel about
25 being a family in this county, in Cochise County. However,

1 one of the speakers, and my purpose for being here is just
2 to comment about one of the speakers, not necessarily about
3 the redistricting.

4 City Council Member Crosby spoke about the
5 district and how he felt the borders should be.

6 I just want to clarify to the Commission that
7 Councilman Crosby spoke for himself. And by the use of the
8 word we, he implied that he was speaking for the City
9 Council of Sierra Vista, and that is not true.

10 He spoke for himself.

11 Thank you.

12 COMMISSIONER McNULTY: Thank you, Ms. Calhoun.

13 The next speaker is Margaret Stephens.

14 MARGARET STEPHENS: Yes, my name is Margaret
15 Stephens, and I thank you for being here. Stephens is
16 spelled S-T-E-P-H-E-N-S.

17 I am not any group. I'm myself. I'm almost
18 80 years old. I've been living here since 1963.

19 I've noticed that the maps on these, especially
20 this congressional map, I'm somewhere along this wiggly
21 line. I don't know whether I come to one or two.

22 Either way, both of the maps are going to split
23 our Palominas School District in half.

24 And I live in Hereford, and that's where the
25 Palominas School District is located.

1 And it is also difficult for me to figure out,
2 since if I ended up in being in number one, it goes all the
3 way up to Utah.

4 And we have nothing in common with anybody up in
5 that area. That would be just like trying to graft a lemon
6 tree onto a pecan tree. They just don't meet.

7 (Applause.)

8 MARGARET STEPHENS: Sorry.

9 But it is, it is -- we have absolutely nothing in
10 common with that part of Arizona. And it's, for myself,
11 it's very difficult to even make the trip from here to
12 Phoenix if I have to, much less to go all the way up there
13 in order to see a congressional member. And I doubt that
14 they would want to travel all this distance to come down
15 here to see anybody down here.

16 So it would be like having nobody. It's almost
17 like for the past year we have not had a representative
18 since our representative was unfortunately shot.

19 And it is -- I agree with everybody that has been
20 up here that we need a complete redrawing of both of the
21 maps.

22 Thank you.

23 (Applause.)

24 COMMISSIONER McNULTY: Thank you.

25 Our next speaker is Jerry L-I-G-O-N, followed by

1 Ruben Ortega, John Haas, and Katie Miller.

2 JERRY LIGON: That's the first time that I haven't
3 had to spell my last name my home self.

4 So, thank you for that, and good evening.

5 And I'd just like -- I have a very short thing to
6 say.

7 I agree with everything that has been spoken so
8 far.

9 For the past ten years some of us in
10 Cochise County, I live in the county, have had to deal with
11 the ridiculously drawn LD 25.

12 For the past ten months we in CD 8 have had no
13 congressional representation due to the terrible incident.

14 I believe that we are due some consideration from
15 this Commission.

16 Thank you.

17 (Applause.)

18 COMMISSIONER McNULTY: Thank you.

19 The next speaker is Ruben Ortega.

20 RUBEN ORTEGA: Thank you, Madam Chair, members of
21 the Commission. My name is Ruben Ortega, O-R-T-E-G-A.

22 I reside in the Hereford area, and currently I'm
23 in Legislative District 25.

24 When people like the lines, it's called
25 redistricting. When people dislike the lines, it's called

1 gerrymandering. So I'm here not to criticize you but to
2 compliment you for taking on this task.

3 Briefly in 1990, as a member of the legislature,
4 the last year the legislature drew lines, I acted as a
5 principal in conjunction with the Mexican-American legal
6 defense and education fund, as well as the southwest voter
7 registration and education project.

8 We convinced the Department of Justice to compel
9 the legislature to draw Legislative District 8 as a new
10 majority-minority district.

11 The year 2000 the Commission drew Legislative
12 District 25.

13 Again, drawing a majority-minority district.

14 I'm here to address what I call the second cousin
15 to Legislative District 8, and that is Legislative
16 District 2.

17 That district's majority-minority makeup is over
18 70 percent.

19 I believe that we border on packing, which is also
20 a violation of the Voting Rights Act.

21 We can avoid retrogression and keep Cochise County
22 all in one legislative district. We don't need a 70 percent
23 majority-minority district in Legislative District 2.

24 You can take the precincts of Douglas, Perryville,
25 Bisbee, Naco, put them back into Legislative District 1, and

1 if you need to pick up additional population, you can pick
2 up that population in Pima County.

3 The Voting Rights Act does not set a percentage as
4 to the number of minorities in the district, but it does say
5 you may not retrogress from the current amount.

6 I do hope that the Commission will keep
7 Cochise County all as one community.

8 Thank you.

9 (Applause.)

10 COMMISSIONER McNULTY: Thank you, Mr. Ortega.
11 John Haas.

12 KATIE MILLER: I'm Katie Miller.

13 COMMISSIONER McNULTY: Okay. Mr. Haas, do you
14 mind if we let Ms. Miller go? Okay.

15 KATIE MILLER: You called me after Mr. Ortega.

16 I'm Katie Miller from St. David, Arizona. Much of
17 the testimony has been given supporting two rural districts
18 in Arizona.

19 You can do this without including Cochise, Graham,
20 and Greenlee.

21 The state has a rural population of 1,420,448.

22 A congressional district needs 710,224 people.

23 If you create the two rural districts, you then
24 have 174,189 people left over, and the population of
25 Cochise, Graham, and Greenlee is approximately 170,000.

1 There's no reason to keep Cochise, Graham, and
2 Greenlee with the rural areas on the congressional map.

3 I also want to address the legislative map, and I
4 am not here as a representative of the school board, but I
5 am on the school board.

6 The fact that you are splitting both Vail and
7 Palominas School Districts in two is abysmal.

8 School districts should be kept -- they're going
9 to have to deal with four representatives and two senators
10 on the legislative side to get any kind of representation in
11 the legislature.

12 I also want to address that with 30 days you
13 cannot even make it into northeast Arizona as a commission.
14 You're going to only use a teleconference to listen to their
15 side of this?

16 And yet you want -- you expect a congressman to
17 cover that entire area when they come home on a weekend.
18 You're going to have 11 counties that have to have
19 congressional offices and staff that will then have to be
20 paid for by the taxpayers of this country and this state.

21 It's abysmal. We want to be whole. We want to
22 have Cochise County whole and get rid of the salamander that
23 goes across the bottom of our border.

24 Thank you.

25 (Applause.)

1 COMMISSIONER McNULTY: Thank you, Ms. Miller.
2 Mr. John Haas.

3 JOHN HAAS: John Haas from Sierra Vista, H-A-A-S.
4 Cochise County has always been a competitive
5 district.

6 When in old maps was competitive, we had part of
7 Pima County, east Pima. We had no problem with that.

8 It was happy. It was competitive. It was still
9 competitive.

10 Up until this last map you kept us whole.
11 Our issue is we want to remain whole.

12 Our county represents over 131,000 approximate
13 population.

14 There's no reason why this county needs to be
15 chopped up and gerrymandered along the border to come up
16 with numbers.

17 Us, Greenlee, and Graham County, and if you send
18 too in Santa Cruz, I mean, that's over about 224,000.

19 There's no reason why you can't keep them
20 four counties whole.

21 There's part of the legislative district map with
22 the snake going along the border, Cochise -- Sierra Vista
23 may not be on the border, but we are a border community.
24 Everything filters. We're center of commerce for this
25 county. And not to have us as a border county, being part

1 of the border, and Cochise County, is preposterous. The
2 gerrymandering has to stop, and we want to keep
3 Cochise County whole. Thank you.

4 (Applause.)

5 COMMISSIONER McNULTY: Thank you.

6 Next will be Diego Vlastic, followed by -- I
7 believe it's Jere Fredenburgh, Jesus Obergon, and Toni
8 Arena.

9 DIEGO VLASIC: All right. My name is Diego
10 Vlastic, V-L-A-S-I-C.

11 I was born in New York City, and for the past
12 five years I've been living in Douglas.

13 I am proud to say that I'm a fourth generation of
14 Gomez family to call Douglas home. I plan to go med school,
15 but I've always been involved in politics. I've spoken
16 before the New York City Council and have lobbied the New
17 York legislature -- New York legislature in Albany. I've
18 always had an interest in running for office.

19 I have come to appreciate Cochise for the way of
20 life it offers, the wide open ranges, the varied cultures,
21 and a way of life that is unique.

22 As I looked at the maps that have been drawn, I
23 couldn't understand why Cochise County is split in half.

24 I understand that by doing so you have gathered
25 7,000 voters from the eastern half of Cochise County and put

1 them into a district that goes from the southern border to
2 the northern border of the state.

3 That's left me wondering how it is possible to
4 truly have 7,000 in eastern Cochise County represented.

5 As I look at Congressional District 1, I wonder
6 how the elected congressional official could truly represent
7 the district well with the amount of communities he would
8 have to represent and the amount of land that he would have
9 to travel.

10 I frankly don't know how or what Double Adobe and
11 McNeal would have in common with Flagstaff other than the
12 fact that they live in the state of Arizona.

13 I wonder if any of you have visited the eastern
14 part of Cochise County.

15 Some say this would create a third district that
16 touches the border, but truly what does that accomplish?

17 The area on the border is just land, not people.

18 If you have disenfranchised the 7,000 citizens
19 from being part of the community and you have torn apart a
20 community, you've torn apart Cochise County.

21 (Applause.)

22 COMMISSIONER McNULTY: Thank you, Mr. Vlastic.

23 Jere Fredenburgh.

24 JERE FREDENBURGH: Jere Fredenburgh, J-E-R-E, last
25 name is Fredenburgh, F-R-E-D-E-N-B-U-R-G-H.

1 I'm going to voice what most -- all of the people
2 have voiced. I want Cochise County whole in both the
3 legislative and congressional districts. Specifically you
4 need to keep Cochise County whole, adding Graham and
5 Greenlee and then east of the Santa Ritas and some portions
6 of south and east Pima County, that would be sufficient for
7 a congressional district.

8 We have nothing in common with northern Arizona.
9 We have nothing in common with the Indian reservations.

10 Legislative, please return Bisbee, Douglas,
11 Pirtleville to Cochise County. Include Graham and Greenlee
12 east of the Santa Ritas, and that should be sufficient
13 population for a legislative district.

14 Our communities revolve around the borders, small
15 towns, ranching, farming.

16 Separating our county into multiple venues will
17 have an adverse effect on our community of interest and is
18 not necessary based on our population.

19 Thank you.

20 (Applause.)

21 COMMISSIONER McNULTY: Thank you,
22 Mrs. Fredenburgh.

23 Jesus Obergon.

24 JESUS OBERGON: Good evening my name is Jesus
25 Obergon, O-B-E-R-G-O-N. And I am a resident of Douglas.

1 Good evening, Chairs and Commission.

2 I would like to thank you for your efforts in this
3 thankless task you have undertaken.

4 I have been a teacher in the Douglas School
5 District for over 40 years and have watched my students
6 either stay or in many cases leave to places of more
7 opportunity.

8 I thought to speak plainly on the competitive
9 nature of this process that you're enveloping here, but I
10 would also like to mention a second factor that would be
11 greatly influenced by the district lines that are drawn.

12 I speak of Douglas because it's a place where I
13 live.

14 And this is one of the cities that take a part as
15 part of the new maps.

16 I speak of also the power that exists in this part
17 of the state which was largely influenced by the creation of
18 I-10 and in continued with the closing of Phelps Dodge. I
19 would like to mention our dependence on a foreign country,
20 Mexico, and its precious to power in Douglas. These are
21 conditions and things that we do not share with Sahuarita,
22 which has an average income of over 32,000, South Tucson, or
23 the reservations to the north, which have access to federal
24 funding.

25 If we elect our representative, we need someone

1 who will represent a our common interest and represent us as
2 part of this state of Arizona.

3 We are also residents of Arizona.

4 Thank you very much.

5 (Applause.)

6 COMMISSIONER McNULTY: Thank you.

7 Okay. Now Ms. Toni Arena, followed by Victor
8 Walker, Michele Emerson-Roberts, and Tricia
9 G-E-R-R-O-D-E-T-T-E.

10 Ms. Arena, go ahead.

11 TONI ARENA: A-R-E-N-A.

12 First I'd like to read a brief statement from the
13 wife of our Cochise County Sheriff Larry Dever, Nancy Dever.
14 She wished to state: Cochise County residents deserve to be
15 represented as one unit. Our county is small, and dividing
16 it for representation takes away any chance that our voice
17 will be heard in state or national legislatures. I travel
18 and work in almost -- is for that real?

19 COMMISSIONER McNULTY: No, that's not for you.

20 TONI ARENA: I didn't think so.

21 I travel and work in every school district across
22 the county. The needs and wants are the same. Cochise
23 County residents deserve to be unified. The people of this
24 county are unified in this request, and we want to be united
25 in our representation.

1 Thank you, Nancy Dever, St. David.

2 I'm speaking on behalf of many ranching families
3 from Portal to Douglas.

4 We've had a tough decade.

5 With no cell coverage, we are the chosen path of
6 the cartels' havoc. This past summer we lost 80 percent of
7 our Chiricahua Mountains. Now we're losing our vote to
8 these maps.

9 We will be designated to the bottom corner of an
10 impossibly large and unwieldy map where our representative
11 is from a city probably three to four hundred miles away.

12 Please reconsider and keep Cochise County
13 together.

14 I also have a brief statement from another
15 ranching family, Peggy Davis from Tombstone.

16 The unification of Cochise County is essential for
17 citizen safety and for national security of the United
18 States of America. Those of us in the border lands have
19 little in common with folks north of Flagstaff. Our
20 representative should be in our geographic area. Please
21 keep Cochise County together in the same district.

22 Brief comment, Roger Barnett, rancher from
23 Douglas, is in full agreement with all these statements.

24 Thank you.

25 (Applause.)

1 COMMISSIONER McNULTY: Thank you.

2 Mr. Victor Walker.

3 VICTOR WALKER: Good afternoon, Madam Chair and
4 commissioners.

5 First I'd like to commend you for your efforts in
6 this huge task that you have taken on.

7 My name is Victor Walker, W-A-L-K-E-R.

8 I've been a resident of Sierra Vista for 23 years
9 working for various contractors at the electronic proving
10 ground of Fort Huachuca. Before that I served 26 years in
11 the United States Navy. My wife is retired from the Sierra
12 Vista school system. Recently I volunteered for nearly
13 three years in a position which took me all over the
14 6200 square miles of this county, talking to citizens about
15 their issues and concerns.

16 Based on my experience, I can report to you that
17 Cochise County is a definable of interest.

18 One facet of that commonality is veterans affairs.

19 Veterans concerns are pretty much the same whether
20 we live in San Simon in the far east part of the county or
21 here in Sierra Vista, a-two-and-a-half-hour drive away.

22 Now, the fact that we have Davis-Monthan and
23 Fort Huachuca in the same congressional district has worked
24 well.

25 I ask the Commission to consider the whole county

1 and specifically as a veteran community when you draw lines
2 that split us up into two competing districts, where
3 veterans may have to travel hugely long distances for
4 services.

5 Veterans are united in defense of this country,
6 and we need a unified voice in our congress and legislature.

7 One thing you can be absolutely sure of is my
8 respect and admiration for this Commission.

9 Yours is a tough job. Thank you for doing it.

10 COMMISSIONER McNULTY: Thank you, Mr. Walker.

11 (Applause.)

12 COMMISSIONER McNULTY: Michele Emerson-Roberts.

13 MICHELE EMERSON-ROBERTS: Michele with one L,
14 Emerson, hyphen, Roberts.

15 I'm a resident of Cochise County. I live in
16 Hereford, but I have a business in Sierra Vista and I have a
17 business in Douglas. My husband and I both do.

18 We want to see Cochise County left whole. There
19 is absolutely no reason on this earth to split us up. We
20 are a community of interest.

21 (Applause.)

22 MICHELE EMERSON-ROBERTS: We have nothing in
23 common with northern Arizona.

24 Leave us alone. That's all we're asking.

25 (Applause.)

1 MICHELE EMERSON-ROBERTS: There's enough
2 population to do that.

3 And according to the Arizona Constitution,
4 C through E, that hasn't been followed, guys. Maybe I don't
5 understand, but it doesn't appear to me to be followed.

6 I listened to the man's speech a while ago, the
7 presentation. I am one of those minorities. And I'm not
8 being represented. My rights, my voting rights, nothing is
9 being represented if you split this county up.

10 Okay?

11 And I would like to say as a business owner in
12 Sierra Vista, Tom speaks for me. Okay.

13 (Applause.)

14 COMMISSIONER McNULTY: Thank you,
15 Ms. Emerson-Roberts.

16 Tricia.

17 I'll let you pronounce your last name for me
18 because I know I am not getting it right.

19 TRICIA GERRODETTE: Yes, good evening,
20 commissioners. My name is Tricia Gerrodette. That's
21 G-E-R-R-O-D-E-T-T-E.

22 And I live in Sierra Vista.

23 What a task.

24 I was intrigued by a sentence here in the cover
25 letter that Chairwoman Mathis wrote. Our task has been to

1 work out a puzzle with no perfect solution.

2 And I think that pretty much captures it. For me
3 and I'm sure for you.

4 That said, I guess I'm grateful that at the
5 legislative level we're not even proposing to split
6 Sierra Vista, which has been a problem or a difficulty.

7 Most people don't wind up knowing what district
8 they're in.

9 But, I do hope that you can find a way to keep
10 Cochise County together, both at the legislative district
11 level and the congressional map level.

12 I do find it interesting and ironic that you
13 listened to the people who wanted three districts on the
14 border, and achieved that. One way to achieve that was to
15 split somebody, and you wound up splitting Cochise County,
16 which we're here to object to.

17 I think your task, if you try to stick with three
18 congressional districts on the border, you're going to split
19 someone else. And so the irony is we don't want to be
20 split, but let someone else be split.

21 So I, again, do not envy you your job, but please
22 do try to keep us together.

23 Thank you.

24 COMMISSIONER McNULTY: Thank you.

25 (Applause.)

1 COMMISSIONER McNULTY: How are we all doing up
2 here? Do you want to take a break? You're sure? You're
3 okay?

4 THE REPORTERS: I'm good.

5 COMMISSIONER McNULTY: The next speaker will be
6 Lee Chadbourn.

7 Followed by Susan Breen, Matt Parilli, and Matt
8 Creegan.

9 LEE CHADBOURN: Hi. My name is Lee Chadbourn.
10 I'm from Sierra Vista. Last name is spelled
11 C-H-A-D-B-O-U-R-N.

12 I'm here just, just like the others. The one
13 thing that I'm coming to you as a request is that from the
14 standpoint of representation, Cochise County has smaller
15 cities. And like Sierra Vista, Douglas, Bisbee, these are
16 smaller cities. They're not metropolitan cities.

17 Like, we're coupled in with Tucson on the other
18 side. And so that type of representation is going to be
19 much different than us.

20 We're more of a rural community.

21 And so I don't see a good representation by
22 coupling us up into Pima County in with Tucson, but to -- it
23 would be much, much beautiful, better representation if you
24 were to keep Cochise County as a whole.

25 In both the congressional and then also the

1 legislative, you're splitting up Palominas, Bisbee, way in
2 the bottom, and taking that and putting it in with another
3 district.

4 And, again, we need to keep the county as a whole.
5 Thank you very much.

6 COMMISSIONER McNULTY: Thank you, Mr. Chadbourn.
7 (Applause.)

8 COMMISSIONER McNULTY: Susan Breen.

9 SUSAN BREEN: Good evening, my name is Susan
10 Breen, B-R-E-E-N.

11 First of all, I want to thank the commissioners
12 for volunteering to do this increasingly thankless job that
13 I understand is a very difficult balancing act.

14 I am a resident of Clifton in Greenlee County, but
15 I do work as an educator in Cochise County.

16 I do not have a problem with the congressional
17 map.

18 I understand that if you're going to keep a
19 congressional district rural, it means the geographical size
20 will have to be huge in order to have populations roughly
21 equal to other CDs, especially as the rural areas of Arizona
22 are losing population.

23 I think that emphasis tonight on the community of
24 interest, it's important, but there are other things to
25 consider, as you all know.

1 As far as the impossibility of one congressional
2 representative covering such a large district, I think it
3 depends on the congressperson.

4 Our congressional representative in 2008 came to
5 Greenlee County five times, was very interested in things
6 that concerned us such as mining and so on.

7 Our Republican representative has never come to
8 Greenlee and has indicated that he will not.

9 I want to talk a little bit about the legislative
10 map, because I don't -- I'm not happy with the legislative
11 map. It's not competitive. And without competitive
12 districts, we don't get candidates. Without candidates, we
13 don't get voters to the polls. And that goes against our
14 democratic process.

15 For example, the legislative -- the first
16 legislative district, LD 1 in the draft map takes the only
17 Democratic part of Cochise, Bisbee and Douglas, and lines
18 them with the most Democratic areas of the state, which is
19 southern Pima and Santa Cruz County to create
20 Legislative District 2.

21 At the same time it takes the only Democratic part
22 of Graham, which is the Apache reservation, and puts it with
23 already Democratic -- heavily Democratic LD 7.

24 That leaves LD 1 completely Republican.

25 Why should any Democrats bother running? Why

1 should they vote?

2 Competition is important, and I hope you will
3 consider it when you come up with a final legislative map.

4 Thank you again.

5 COMMISSIONER McNULTY: Thank you, Ms. Breen.

6 (Applause.)

7 COMMISSIONER McNULTY: Matt Parrilli?

8 MATT PARRILLI: Thank you.

9 My name is Matt Parrilli, and I am a resident of
10 the Sonoita/Elgin area just west of Fort Huachuca at the
11 eastern edge of Santa Cruz County.

12 I come here to address an egregious wrong in the
13 current redistricting process.

14 The current draft congressional and legislative
15 district maps proposed by the Commission for Sonoita/Elgin
16 area pose a significant detriment to that community.

17 In both these cases, the residents of our
18 community have been stripped of districts CD 8 and LD 30
19 that have proven satisfactory and workable over the past
20 ten years.

21 The proposed boundaries for the new districts
22 appear nothing more than to assure a minority-majority for
23 Hispanics in the proposed CD 3 and LD 2.

24 Let me make it clear that I'm not against that.

25 What I am against is the total disregard for

1 communities of interest in favor of competitiveness and
2 over-reliance on population balance and contiguity.

3 Two examples of that are splitting of Cochise
4 County in two, which makes flow sense, and the ridiculous
5 extension of the new LD 2 and CD 3 districts into the
6 carving of liberal and Hispanic locales such as Naco and
7 Douglas of the so-called salamander.

8 Bear in mind that in 1993 *Shaw v. Reno*, and in
9 several cases since, the U.S. Supreme Court has ruled that
10 the equal protection provisions of the 14th Amendment are
11 violated when district lines are so irregular that it can
12 only be viewed as an effort to separate the races for
13 purposes of voting.

14 And I quote: The message that such districting
15 sends to elected representatives is equally pernicious when
16 a district obviously is created only to effectuate the
17 perceived common interest of one racial group elected
18 officials are more likely to believe that their primary
19 obligation is to represent only the members of that group,
20 rather than their constituency as a whole. This is
21 altogether antithetical to our system of democracy, end
22 quote.

23 The Commission has made a point on the proviso for
24 competitiveness as a basis for many of the proposed
25 boundaries. In fact, Proposition 106, the will of the

1 people subordinates competitiveness to communities of
2 interest.

3 Populations naturally coalesce around common
4 values, beliefs, and interests, forming communities.

5 It is not within the purview of government to
6 forcefully rend those communities asunder to favor some
7 other form or interest.

8 That is social engineering and a loathsome concept
9 inimical to the constitutional guarantees of life, liberty,
10 and the pursuit of happiness.

11 Prop 106 also calls for districts having equal
12 population to the extent practicable.

13 I grant you that the term practicable is somewhat
14 of a subjective, but it clearly allows for population
15 variances from district to district where it makes sense to
16 do so, especially where it preserves the other objectives
17 and is in concert with the will of the people. Let us never
18 forget that the source of the power of government is the
19 consent of the government.

20 I have several items that I will wish to briefly
21 address to make the case for moving the district
22 boundaries of CD 2 and LD 1 to the west to incorporate
23 Sonoita/Elgin with Cochise County/Sierra Vista as a
24 community of interest.

25 Our area is a sparsely populated area with a high

1 proportion of livestock and agricultural enterprises to
2 include a burgeoning wine making sector. There are but
3 three wine trails in Arizona: Verde Valley, Sonoita, and
4 Wilcox.

5 Under my proposal, the latter two would share the
6 same representatives.

7 In that regard, this area is not at all like
8 western and northern reaches of the Commission's proposed
9 LD 2 and CD 3.

10 It is far more in line --

11 COMMISSIONER McNULTY: Let's finish -- let's
12 finish up so that everyone has a chance.

13 And we'll be happy to take your written comments
14 into the record.

15 MATT PARRILLI: In addition Sonoita has an area of
16 significant populations of retired military person, 60,
17 representing six percent of the population of Sonoita/Elgin.
18 They all use the facilities at Huachuca, the PX, the
19 commissary, and the veterans affairs clinic in Sierra Vista.

20 There are a number of persons also living there
21 who work on the fort, and they overwhelmingly shop in
22 Sierra Vista and not Nogales.

23 Further, many of the forementioned people and many
24 of the others use the west gate to enter Huachuca in Sierra
25 Vista.

1 Just two years ago the officials from the Fort
2 wanted to close the gate --

3 (Brief interruption.)

4 COMMISSIONER McNULTY: Time to give someone else a
5 turn. Please submit your written comments.

6 MATT PARRILLI: All right. I'll leave those with
7 you.

8 COMMISSIONER McNULTY: Thank you very much, Mr. --

9 MATT PARRILLI: And there are hats --

10 (Applause.)

11 COMMISSIONER McNULTY: Okay. Mr. Shields, right
12 behind you, can take those for the record.

13 Our next speaker is Matt Creegan.

14 He'll be followed by Robert Leach, Rich Brownell,
15 Andre Newcomb, and Robert Fleming.

16 MATTHEW CREEGAN: My name is Matthew Creegan,
17 C-R-E-E-G-A-N.

18 I'm a resident of Cochise County and Hereford.

19 I'd like to thank you for coming down to meet with us.

20 I will echo many of the sentiments of
21 commissioner -- excuse me, of Supervisor English, the mayor
22 of Douglas, and for Tom Crosby the councilman in
23 Sierra Vista.

24 I live in Hereford, but I do run an office in
25 Sierra Vista. And much like Ms. Emerson-Roberts I wish to

1 say Councilman Crosby speaks for me as well.

2 (Applause.)

3 MATTHEW CREEGAN: Last time you were here was
4 August 4th.

5 Many of the people speaking said the same thing
6 then.

7 You didn't listen to us.

8 Please listen to us now.

9 Cochise County must remain whole.

10 The CD east Cochise County has nothing in common
11 with Flagstaff.

12 Last time, folks from Santa Cruz County came, and
13 they claim they had nothing in common with Tucson.

14 Cochise County has less in common with Flagstaff
15 than that.

16 If you're from Portal or Douglas and you have a
17 problem, you have to see your congressman, about Social
18 Security issues, whatever. You have to travel about
19 five hours or so to go to Flagstaff.

20 Madam Chairman, just tonight, when you greeted
21 Commissioner Stertz, you said it was a long way from Tucson.
22 Well, it's even longer to go to Flagstaff.

23 (Applause.)

24 MATTHEW CREEGAN: Cutting off the bottom of
25 Cochise County is nothing but gerrymandering on your part.

1 I would like to see that corrected.

2 The Commission's transparent effort to benefit one
3 political party in the state over another makes a mockery of
4 our redistricting laws.

5 This map was drawn with an undeniable partisan
6 bias.

7 Please fix it.

8 Thank you.

9 (Applause.)

10 COMMISSIONER McNULTY: Thank you. Our next
11 speaker is Robert -- settle down -- Robert Leach, L-E-A-C-H.

12 ROBERT LEACH: Correct. Thank you. I'm from
13 Sierra Vista as well.

14 First I'd like to thank the Commission and
15 Strategic Telemetry for doing a fine, absolutely perfect job
16 so far.

17 I commend you all.

18 Despite the continued assault by the Tea Party
19 candidates who have politicized the independent process that
20 was voted for by the people --

21 (Brief interruption.)

22 COMMISSIONER McNULTY: Hey, hey, hey. We can
23 respect one another or we can adjourn.

24 One or the other.

25 ROBERT LEACH: In fact, I would like to ask --

1 COMMISSIONER McNULTY: Settle down, everyone.

2 ROBERT LEACH: -- the U.S. Department of Justice
3 to investigate Tom Horne's investigation of this Commission.
4 Tom Horne opened up an investigation right after he stated
5 they, his office, don't have any reason to believe that
6 anything was done wrong.

7 This means his investigation is purely political
8 and has undertones of interference.

9 I will also call on the Department of Justice to
10 investigate Tom Crosby's use of we.

11 (Brief interruption.)

12 ROBERT LEACH: Although I'm not a resident of
13 Hereford, I am a free thinker. I do believe you have done a
14 pretty good job with the legislative maps, but there's still
15 room for improvement.

16 According to your legal overview on your website,
17 in Arizona Minority Coalition, the Arizona Supreme Court
18 suggests that the IRC's advertised maps should make
19 adjustments for all six goals specified in subsections 114A
20 through F, rather than addressing the sixth of
21 competitiveness only after receiving public comment on the
22 first advertised map as the IRC did on 2002.

23 With that said when you look at the Legislative
24 Districts 1 and 2, there's a huge disparity between the
25 registered voters.

1 LD 1 has 42 percent -- all right.

2 COMMISSIONER McNULTY: LD 1 has 42 percent.

3 ROBERT LEACH: LD 1 has 42 percent registered
4 Republican while it only has 26 percent Democratic.

5 In LD 2, 20.7 percent are Republican and
6 46 percent are registered Democratic.

7 By shifting the maps to include more LD 2
8 Democrats than in LD 1, you could create two fairly
9 competitive districts within five percent while also
10 protecting minority-majority elements along the border.

11 This would support what the Arizona Supreme Court
12 stated about making adjustments for competitive districts.

13 With regards to the congressional map, I would ask
14 the Commission to leave the IRC approved map alone.

15 The people are stronger than any border line
16 drawn.

17 And if a U.S. senator can represent the entire
18 state, so can a congressperson.

19 Additionally I would like to add that the
20 population of this state does not reflect the red state.
21 The population reflects an independent neutral state.
22 However, this is not reflected in our state legislature.

23 Thank you.

24 (Applause.)

25 COMMISSIONER McNULTY: Thank you.

1 Our next speaker is Rich Brownell.

2 RICH BROWNELL: My name is spelled
3 B-R-O-W-N-E-L-L. And I'm from Sierra Vista.

4 And, I'd like to thank the Commission for coming
5 down and listening to us.

6 It sounds like we're pretty much speaking one
7 voice down here tonight.

8 I want to address the legislative map.

9 And I want to remind the Commission that
10 Cochise County is indeed a community of interest. And we're
11 a community of interest with regard to natural assets such
12 as water, the San Pedro riparian.

13 We are a community of interest with cultural
14 assets such as libraries. Sierra Vista has a large
15 semi-regional library, and it trades books with towns that
16 will would now be in the salamander.

17 Our school districts are being split apart.

18 And our economic assets, such as tourism, overlap
19 greatly.

20 And, again, thank you very much for your time in
21 coming here.

22 COMMISSIONER McNULTY: Thank you, Mr. Brownell.

23 (Applause.)

24 COMMISSIONER McNULTY: Our next speaker is Andre
25 Newcomb.

1 ANDRE NEWCOMB: Good evening. My name is Andre
2 Newcomb, N-E-W-C-O-M-B.

3 Legislatively I think what you're doing is trying
4 to maintain a rural presence in the legislature. And I
5 thank you very much for respecting us like that.

6 I'm not making a joke. I thank you.

7 Ten years ago you also tried to do that. After
8 CAP went online, you tried to draw a line where we would --
9 our district would follow the water.

10 And that was very respectful also of you, and I
11 thank you.

12 Congressionally, that district on the east side,
13 that's more than a 400-mile swath. That is requiring a
14 lot -- an awful lot for people to see their congressperson
15 and it is also requiring an awful lot of congressional staff
16 to do their duties.

17 It's very dangerous for them to have to cover so
18 much territory.

19 I would hope that you would reconsider that
20 district over there.

21 Personally, this is -- here in Sierra Vista we
22 have four stores now. You gave us a freeway, Phoenix and
23 Tucson, you gave us a freeway. We have 13 screens now. We
24 have three new TV stations in Tucson. We have a University
25 of Arizona. Our hospital's doing fine. You folks in

1 Phoenix help our schools stay alive, you know.

2 You know, you trying to keep the rural presence
3 alive in Phoenix is -- I thank you very much for that. And
4 I respect what you're doing. I trust that you will continue
5 to do a good job. Thank you very much.

6 (Applause.)

7 COMMISSIONER McNULTY: Thank you.

8 Our next speaker is Robert Fleming.

9 Mr. Fleming will be followed about Joy Mims,
10 Elizabeth Bernstein, and Vera Hylsky.

11 BOB FLEMING: Bob Fleming. That's F-L-E-M-I-N-G,
12 one M.

13 I live just south of Sierra Vista in
14 Cochise County, and I appreciate you being here.

15 It's very obvious that the existence of the IRC
16 removes the conflict of interest that would exist if the
17 legislature were deciding on the districts themselves.

18 It is important to meet most criteria and also
19 have as many competitive districts as possible in order to
20 make sure that all Arizona citizens are truly represented.

21 I am concerned about this sort of a tail on LD 2.
22 Much of what I have to say has already been said.

23 But, what that, what that means it's not compact.

24 And as I look at the map geographically, it looks
25 like the only one that is not.

1 As a community of interest, especially
2 geographically, Bisbee and Douglas have more in common with
3 Cochise County than it does Santa Cruz County, and that is,
4 you know, whether it's socially, geographically, community
5 resources, and lifestyles. And I believe that Bisbee and
6 Douglas would be better represented if they were together
7 with Cochise County.

8 That being said, please reconsider the boundaries
9 of LD 1 and LD 2 and put Bisbee and Douglas into LD 1, which
10 in my opinion would make both districts relatively
11 competitive with little or no sacrifice of other criteria
12 and still I believe it would comply with the Voting Rights
13 Act.

14 Thank you.

15 (Applause.)

16 COMMISSIONER McNULTY: Thank you, Mr. Fleming.

17 Joy Mims.

18 JOY MIMS: My name is Joy Mims, M-I-M-S. I'm from
19 Sierra Vista, and I am an educator at Fort Huachuca
20 Accommodation Schools and I currently teach kindergarten.

21 Good evening, commissioners. Thank you for being
22 here.

23 I realize being on the Commission is a difficult
24 task, and I appreciate you being on it.

25 I'd like to share my personal perspective here.

1 I've lived in Cochise County for 28 years.
2 Following four years of living on Fort Huachuca as a
3 military family, we moved to Benson. I lived in Benson for
4 20 years.

5 Four years ago I moved back to Sierra Vista.

6 When I changed my voter registration to my new
7 address, I was shocked and confused to realize I was not in
8 the same legislative district as Cochise County.

9 For the past four years I felt alienated
10 politically from my friends and family in Cochise County
11 and definitely felt underrepresented in Legislative
12 District 30.

13 What I'm seeing now with the proposed legislative
14 districts is the same separation of a community and lack of
15 competitiveness.

16 These maps are alienating members of the same
17 community.

18 Our school districts will be split.

19 Bisbee is our county seat. Our county fair is in
20 Douglas.

21 They both should be in the same LD as the rest of
22 the county.

23 Cochise County -- all of Cochise County is our
24 community of interest.

25 Thank you very much for listening.

1 (Applause.)

2 COMMISSIONER McNULTY: Thank you, Ms. Mims.

3 Elizabeth Bernstein.

4 ELIZABETH BERNSTEIN: Honorable members of the
5 Commission, thank you for the opportunity to speak.

6 I'm a resident of Bisbee. My name is Elizabeth
7 Bernstein. Elizabeth with a Z. Bernstein is
8 B-E-R-N-S-T-E-I-N.

9 In the year 2000 when the voters of Arizona
10 deliberately removed the process of redistricting from the
11 legislature and vested it in this Commission, the publicity
12 pamphlet in favor of the successful Proposition 106 called
13 it a conflict of interest for legislatures -- legislators to
14 create their own districts.

15 Today across the state and across the country we
16 see that citizens are sick of the situation in which those
17 who hold positions of power and privilege rig the game to
18 disadvantage those who seek to come after them, sick of the
19 situation where elections are determined before the votes
20 are cast.

21 If it were simply a matter of contiguous, compact
22 districts or communities of interest, the legislature could
23 have been trusted to continue handling redistricting.

24 What the legislature could not be trusted to do,
25 what this Commission was created to do, was to create

1 competitive districts. Districts that would not be locked
2 in safe for incumbents.

3 I understand that this Commission is getting
4 pressure from two sides.

5 There are representatives of majority-minority
6 districts who are now advocating for super majority
7 majority-minority districts.

8 And federal law does require that minorities
9 maintain their previous ability to elect the candidates of
10 their choice.

11 But as Mr. Ortega noted earlier, it's also a
12 violation of the Voting Rights Act to pack minorities
13 into a small number of districts to the detriment of
14 competitiveness.

15 The currently proposed legislative maps statewide
16 goes to too far in the direction of packing. For example,
17 with over -- with four districts of over 60 percent minority
18 and additional districts with over 50 percent minority
19 majority.

20 That goes way beyond the concentration of
21 minorities that are seen in our current federally approved
22 legislative maps.

23 I urge the Commission to alter the legislative
24 maps in the direction of less packing and more
25 competitiveness.

1 On the congressional side, we have politicians
2 claiming that the draft map is too competitive, even
3 suggesting that the state rightly belongs to one party.

4 The state of Arizona does not belong to any party.
5 No party claims more than 35 percent voter registration, and
6 the makeup of our congressional delegations has been
7 changing from one election to the next.

8 Three competitive traditional districts is good as
9 far as it goes. Four or five would be even better.

10 If this Commission were to allow the politicians
11 to tell it what lines to draw, it will have failed the task
12 given it by the voters and negated the main reason for its
13 existence.

14 I thank you for all of your efforts, and
15 considerable efforts, and I urge you to stand firm for
16 maximum competitiveness.

17 COMMISSIONER McNULTY: Thank you, Ms. Bernstein.

18 (Applause.)

19 COMMISSIONER McNULTY: Vera Hylsky, who will be
20 followed by Sandy Hummingbird, Dr. Fred Thomson, and Kale
21 Kiyabu.

22 UNIDENTIFIED AUDIENCE MEMBER: I don't think Vera
23 is here.

24 COMMISSIONER McNULTY: Vera has left.

25 So let's move on to Sandy Hummingbird.

1 SANDY HUMMINGBIRD: My name is Sandy Hummingbird,
2 H-U-M-M-I-N-G-B-I-R-D.

3 Thank you for coming to see us, and thank you for
4 all of your efforts.

5 I've lived in -- okay.

6 I've lived in Arizona for 25 years and in Bisbee
7 for 15.

8 I participate in many of the activities of
9 Cochise County.

10 As suggested by the Supreme Court of Arizona,
11 redistricting maps should be shared -- should be -- attend
12 to all six of the goals specifically -- and specifically
13 equal.

14 I feel the current maps are lax in attending to
15 the competitiveness and the communities of interest.

16 We need fair districts and fair politics in this
17 decade. We need districts that will represent all
18 Arizonans.

19 Today voter registration figures show that the
20 party affiliations are approximately one third for each,
21 Democrat, Republican, and Independents.

22 We need balanced and fair districts that actually
23 reflect our state electorate.

24 When opposite party candidates actually have to
25 compete for the vote, they must talk to all their

1 constituents, not just to their party, to gain the vote.

2 This encourages higher civic involvement and
3 higher voter participation as a result.

4 Voters must feel that their voices count in an
5 election.

6 It's documented in the community activities in
7 cross county events reported by our shared area of media
8 that Cochise County is a community of interest.

9 We cross towns, rivers, interstate and local
10 highways, to participate in county activities.

11 We share libraries, service clubs, colleges,
12 health care systems.

13 Grants and funding are often by the community.

14 Splitting it could pit area against area for the
15 same funding by different representatives.

16 Now, I realize that asking for a whole
17 Cochise County could create other problems in other areas
18 and even make the map worse for us.

19 But while the current CD map does show some
20 competitiveness, it does divide our community of interest.

21 Moving eastern Cochise County into District 2,
22 specifically, would accomplish this without dissolving
23 competitiveness.

24 Pulling the southern border towns of Cochise
25 County, including the county seat, into a different

1 legislative district splits over 29,000 people.

2 A little tweaking of this to move these towns into
3 the District 1 on the legislative map with the rest of the
4 county would make both districts more competitive.

5 Now, I know two changes that I'm asking for are
6 very specific, but they would address all the other issues.

7 It's possible to keep communities of interest and
8 still create competitive districts.

9 I urge you to consider these changes in the
10 current maps.

11 Thank you.

12 (Applause.)

13 COMMISSIONER McNULTY: Thank you, Ms. Hummingbird.

14 (Applause.)

15 COMMISSIONER McNULTY: Dr. Fred Thomson.

16 FRED THOMSON: I am Dr. Fred Thomson. And I live
17 in Sierra Vista.

18 I am a dry Thomson. My name is spelled,
19 T-H-O-M-S-O-N, no P.

20 Let me first express my disappointment and even
21 disgust at the Commission's alleged conduct with respect to
22 the Arizona open meeting law.

23 I urge all members of this commission to cooperate
24 fully with the Attorney General's investigation of alleged
25 violations.

1 (Applause.)

2 FRED THOMSON: Not doing so raises serious
3 questions of malfeasance and/or fiduciary responsibility.

4 My main concern tonight however is the
5 redistricting maps proposed by the Commission. I strongly
6 object to the Commission's apparent emphasis on
7 competitiveness to the detriment of the other criteria
8 mandated by Article IV, Part 2, section one, of the Arizona
9 Constitution.

10 This provision permits competitiveness to be
11 considered only when to do so will not create a significant
12 detriment to the five other goals, all of which are
13 mandated.

14 These five goals are not simply permissive. Their
15 achievement is mandated.

16 Thus, to conform with the Arizona Constitution,
17 competitiveness must be ignored unless and until the other
18 goals have been met.

19 They have not been met by the maps you have
20 presented.

21 Goal three, for instance, mandates that districts
22 shall be geographically compact and contiguous.

23 Your congressional map of 10-2-11 splits
24 Cochise County in half. Attaching the eastern half of
25 Cochise County to bits of other counties as far-flung as

1 Coconino makes no sense.

2 Just what community of interest is being respected
3 here?

4 Redo the maps. We don't want to be divided.

5 Thank you.

6 (Applause.)

7 COMMISSIONER McNULTY: Okay. Our next speaker is
8 Kale -- I'm going to let him pronounce his last name.

9 Thank you.

10 He'll followed by Iris Lynch, Marie Wagner, and
11 Mark Stonebraker.

12 KALE KIYABU: Kale Kiyabu. First name K-A-L-E,
13 last name K-I-Y-A-B-U.

14 I live here in Sierra Vista.

15 I've just got something short.

16 I'm assuming that what we say here is being
17 tallied up and based on the tally you make some changes or
18 not, so that's why I'm here.

19 I think that Cochise County ought to be whole.

20 The suggestion for a good starting place to go
21 back and possibly redraw the maps is the grid map that you
22 showed.

23 I liked the way the grid map looked.

24 That's all I have to say.

25 Thank you.

1 (Applause.)

2 COMMISSIONER McNULTY: Thank you.

3 Our next speaker is Iris Lynch.

4 (No oral response.)

5 COMMISSIONER McNULTY: Marie Wagner.

6 MARIE WAGNER: My name is Marie Wagner,

7 W-A-G-N-E-R.

8 I came down here tonight to address concerns about
9 your plans to divide Cochise County, both legislatively and
10 congressionally.

11 This has never, I repeat never been done in our
12 history of Cochise County.

13 First, I question if you happen to study your
14 guidelines for the redistricting process.

15 Why do I ask such a preliminary question?

16 Because the guidelines you missed read as follows,
17 quote: The districts shall be geographically compact and
18 contiguous to the extent practicable, unquote.

19 Now let's look at the legislative map.

20 As you can see, Cochise County is not
21 geographically compact. It -- plainly it's chopped up.

22 Even to the extent of stealing squiggles along the
23 southern border cutting out Bisbee and Douglas.

24 Pretty uncompact, as you can see.

25 Now to the congressional map.

1 Can we say chop liver?

2 Again, Cochise County is not compact, but actually
3 cut in half.

4 This is -- there is a tiny bit left on the border
5 of Mexico. Then it goes north and goes north and north some
6 more, clear up to Utah.

7 Now, add on large chunks westward in two places.
8 It is totally and completely uncompact.

9 Please allow me to aid you as you go back to the
10 drawing board.

11 Compact, accordingly to Webster, means thusly,
12 quote: Having parts or units closely packed or joined,
13 occupying small volume by reason of efficient use of space,
14 unquote.

15 There is more, but I think we'll all agree that
16 neither of these maps fit the definition of geographically
17 compact.

18 And as an aside, I totally agree with Tom Crosby
19 on all of his remarks.

20 (Applause.)

21 COMMISSIONER McNULTY: Thank you, Mrs. Wagner.

22 Next speaker Mark Stone -- I think this says
23 braker. Is that right?

24 He'll be followed by Casey Jones, David Penrose,
25 and Bob Evans.

1 MARK STONEBRAKER: Commissioners McNulty and
2 Stertz, thank you for coming down today.

3 I'm Mark Stonebraker. It's S-T-O-N-E-B-R-A-K-E-R.

4 I want to register my support for the IRC process
5 and Proposition 106.

6 Even though not everyone will be happy with any
7 compromise, it's better to keep part partisan politics out
8 of this process.

9 As others have said.

10 I've been -- I've lived in Cochise County for
11 13 years.

12 And I have felt often that my vote was futile.
13 And I think if we split off these other three -- these
14 three communities from our district, that will make it even
15 less balanced, I believe.

16 It's critical that candidates be able to address
17 the needs of everyone in the community, not just their own
18 party. So I ask for competitiveness there.

19 I think I would like to see my friends and
20 neighbors remain in the same district with me, but
21 District 2, the new proposed District 2, would have
22 66 percent minorities, which I think is plenty for a
23 minority district.

24 If you put these communities back in our district,
25 I don't think it would affect that too much, and would give

1 us better balance.

2 So I think you've done an excellent job otherwise.
3 It's too bad I have to just dwell on the things that I don't
4 like, but thank you very much for doing you did.

5 COMMISSIONER McNULTY: Thank you, Mr. Stonebraker.
6 (Applause.)

7 COMMISSIONER McNULTY: Casey Jones.

8 CASEY JONES: My name is Casey Jones, C-A-S-E-Y,
9 J-O-N-E-S.

10 I'm a retired Army officer. I resigned -- I
11 resided in Sierra Vista Fort Huachuca since 1976.

12 I'm here by choice, and I like it here.

13 We asked you down or you invited yourself down in
14 August, and you heard a lot of people then talk about our
15 community of interest. And I'd like to address a couple of
16 those communities of interest.

17 One of the really -- things I'm most proud of in
18 my life is that I'm a 35-year volunteer for the Special
19 Olympics.

20 I spent a good number of years as the area
21 director for Special Olympics for Sierra Vista and Douglas.

22 That's a community of interest.

23 And you've ignored it, and I resent it.

24 (Applause.)

25 CASEY JONES: You have drawn lines which separate

1 school districts.

2 There is no more important community of interest
3 than our children and their education.

4 And you have ignored it.

5 (Applause.)

6 CASEY JONES: You have a very difficult job. I
7 will grant you that.

8 I also had the good fortune for be a -- or I have
9 the good fortune to be an ex-city council member here in
10 Sierra Vista.

11 In my short political career, it came very early
12 to a conclusion that in the political process logic and
13 common sense doesn't always prevail.

14 Unfortunately in all too many and perhaps the
15 majority of cases, it need not even be considered.

16 You have heard a lot of logic and common sense
17 here tonight.

18 I plead with you do not ignore it.

19 Thank you.

20 COMMISSIONER McNULTY: Thank you, Mr. Jones.

21 (Applause.)

22 COMMISSIONER McNULTY: Penrose, David.

23 DAVID PENROSE: A little short here.

24 Okay. David Penrose, D-A-V-I-D, P-E-N-R-O-S-E.

25 I good, simple '40s name.

1 I live in Sierra Vista southeast, just north of
2 the Hereford line.

3 To begin with, I've heard questions on what
4 competitiveness is. Best way to put it is a competitive
5 district would be like the Indiana Congressional District 8
6 back in the '70s in the Evansville area.

7 Basically either party -- both parties were
8 winning within about five percent of the vote during that
9 time period, and they had four or five different congressmen
10 in that area.

11 That's what I consider competitiveness.

12 Now, the two maps that you've drawn up, number
13 one, you've taken the -- about, I hear, 7300 people over in
14 eastern end of our county.

15 Really, what do ranchers there have to do with
16 either Flagstaff or the Casa Grande area?

17 You would be much better served giving us back
18 those people with the rest of the county, and getting people
19 from the Marana, Oro Valley, Cortaro farms area along I-10,
20 which would be more in a community interest with the people
21 with Eloy to Casa Grande who are also in CD 1.

22 Okay.

23 And with the LD 1, LD 2 now, if I read that map
24 correctly, the people who live on the north or west of the
25 Bisbee city limits are just outside that district, even

1 though they live -- they are basically Bisbeeites. They
2 just happen to be outside the city limits.

3 I think that's what you make a line with. I
4 couldn't be sure looking at it last night.

5 And dividing Hereford, Palominas, along Coronado,
6 through Canyon Road and Palominas and Hereford Roads, splits
7 both the community -- splits the school and other
8 communities of interest most definitely.

9 Please give us back our, the people from the south
10 county. Incidentally, unlike others here, I live in the
11 Sierra Vista area, but I do business in the Bisbee area.
12 Self-employed, but still. My people are down in Bisbee and
13 Douglas, not Sierra Vista.

14 That's basic comment.

15 COMMISSIONER McNULTY: Thank you, Mr. Penrose.

16 (Applause.)

17 COMMISSIONER McNULTY: Bob Evans will be next,
18 followed by Eric Fast, Lee Thoming, and Maryjane Mahland --
19 Mahland.

20 BOB EVANS: My name is Bob Evans. I have been a
21 CPA in Sierra Vista since 1980. I've served all of
22 Cochise County. And I think I have a feel for the social
23 and economic ties that bind the county together, and I'd
24 like to say that I believe they're strong.

25 I would also like to second the comments that I

1 would hope that the Commission would relieve themselves of
2 the cloud that they have allowed to gather over their heads
3 for the lack of cooperation in terms of the investigation of
4 the open meeting laws.

5 The maps that you have drawn up -- and I do
6 appreciate the difficulty and the efforts that have gone
7 into them, but I believe that they, as it relates to
8 Cochise County, they violate all of the criteria that is in
9 the Constitution, except for probably the Voting Rights Act
10 and equal population.

11 Surely the little squiggle along the bottom to
12 take in Bisbee and Douglas, and the strip along the eastern
13 side of the state, which I guess is there to at least in
14 name incorporate three border districts, break up, break up
15 this continuity.

16 And, I believe that they violate that compactness
17 and contiguous that is required by the Constitution.

18 They clearly violate the communities of interest.

19 The people in the eastern part of the county
20 clearly relate to the rest of the county, not to the areas
21 north up to Utah and Flagstaff.

22 Boy, that goes fast, doesn't it?

23 But going on, the geographic features of -- again,
24 would indicate, you know, with the various mountain ranges,
25 the roads, and whatnot, Cochise County be a contiguous area.

1 And ironically, I believe that the one that --
2 particularly Republicans, which I admit to being one, are
3 concerned about competitiveness, I believe that those
4 changes would make both areas more competitive between the
5 two major parties in the state instead of less competitive.

6 And, as a last point, Ruben Ortega's comments as
7 relating to packing districts, I think when you try to take
8 in Douglas along with Nogales to generate a very Hispanic
9 district, you probably are packing the district and may end
10 up having that resolved by the courts.

11 I hope not.

12 Thank you very much for your time.

13 (Applause.)

14 COMMISSIONER McNULTY: Thank you, Mr. Evans.

15 Eric Fast.

16 ERIC FAST: Good evening. E-R-I-C, middle initial
17 B., last name F-A-S-T.

18 I believe you've heard maybe from some minorities
19 here.

20 I felt somewhat intimidated by the person in the
21 movie at the beginning speaking about minorities, but I
22 think you heard from them here, and some majorities who were
23 left out.

24 This -- I do have questions about the judicial
25 commission appointing this Commission.

1 I do have questions about some of your actions and
2 decisions to redistrict some -- changing the competitiveness
3 of some districts from 4 percent to over 100 percent in the
4 other -- with another party.

5 I also -- and I feel I have lost some
6 representation myself, which I thought we were all about.

7 And may we remind some who feel the need to lash
8 out about other parties, that even our council members have
9 a right to free speech as the rest of us do.

10 (Applause.)

11 ERIC FAST: I support Tom Crosby and others on the
12 council more than I do one or two of them.

13 I believe that the districts to -- the decision
14 that you have come to in this last map, which is only
15 brought in as a very last map and opposed to by two of the
16 members of the Commission, misrepresents our county down
17 here.

18 And you've heard the -- numerous times the
19 violation of the Arizona Constitution in compactness, common
20 interests, and so forth, in redistricting. Some of these,
21 they cross hundreds of miles, is certainly not
22 representative of the people.

23 It is preposterous and unreasonable to do so.

24 So in that, my only say to you is that I would
25 recommend -- and I would like to say to you, as one citizen

1 who gives authority to those that are in elected positions,
2 I would like -- and who are hired by the people, to
3 reconsider this county and rejoin it.

4 Thank you.

5 COMMISSIONER McNULTY: Thank you.

6 (Applause.)

7 COMMISSIONER McNULTY: Lee Thoming.

8 LEE THOMING: I've really shortened down the
9 amount of remarks that I intend to make.

10 By Matt -- I agree entirely with Matt Creegan.

11 COMMISSIONER McNULTY: Would you spell your name.

12 LEE THOMING: Oh, my name is Lee Thoming,
13 T-H-O-M-I-N-G.

14 COMMISSIONER McNULTY: Thank you.

15 LEE THOMING: And I agree with, to shorten things
16 up, I agree with Matt Creegan. And also I agree with
17 Dr. Thomson, that been so many issues have been brought up
18 tonight of a legal nature that we need to get the
19 investigation by the Attorney General.

20 And I want to see Cochise County as one, one
21 county -- you look at the map there, and remember this is
22 going to go to a judge.

23 That squiggly marks down there in the lower part
24 of our county is a textbook -- in fact, go to the old
25 encyclopedias and look up gerrymandering, and they will have

1 that exact type of illustration in there.

2 And that's all I have to say.

3 CHAIRPERSON MATHIS: Thank you.

4 (Applause.)

5 COMMISSIONER McNULTY: Maryjane Mahland.

6 Morris Farr.

7 Mr. Farr will be followed by Jim Behnke, Charles
8 Carlson, and Sally Acevedo.

9 MORRIS FARR: Good evening. My name is spelled
10 M-O-R-R-I-S, F-A-R-R.

11 Commissioners, you'll probably be happy to know
12 that I have no position to take on the splitting of Cochise
13 County.

14 I live in Sonoita, and I am here tonight basically
15 because I'm going to be out of town when you have your
16 hearing in Nogales in a few days.

17 But what I do want to do is I want to represent
18 the position of Arizona Borderlands Democrats. That's our
19 organization in Patagonia and Sonoita.

20 And the issue I want to quickly discuss with you
21 is actually not a partisan issue. It's one that we are very
22 concerned with in Sonoita and Patagonia. Namely it is the
23 Rosemont Mine.

24 I'm not going to harangue you on the pros or the
25 cons of the opposition to that mine, but I will suggest that

1 that is probably the issue in Sonoita and Patagonia. It's
2 one that unites Democrats and Republicans and one that we
3 are all very concerned with.

4 And we think that it would be of some advantage to
5 us to be physically located in the same congressional
6 district as the mine. That would make it easier for us to
7 lobby.

8 And as I say that, I want to also point out that
9 we have enjoyed tremendous support from both of our congress
10 people from southern Arizona. Both Gabrielle Giffords and
11 Raul Grijalva have been great in supporting our cause.

12 What we think as we look to the future and the
13 issue that's going to be going on for, we suspect, for quite
14 a few years to come, that it would be advantageous to us in
15 our opposition to be able to communicate directly with the
16 congressman -- congressperson who has that mine in their
17 district.

18 That's the point that I wanted to bring up with
19 you tonight.

20 And I also suggest that we have a general
21 preference for competitive districts.

22 And I believe we have sent an e-mail to you about
23 that earlier, and I will do that e-mail again, just so that
24 you be sure to have it.

25 Thank you very much.

1 (Applause.)

2 COMMISSIONER McNULTY: Thank you, Mr. Farr.

3 Jim Behnke.

4 JIM BEHNKE: Jim Behnke, spelled B-E-H-N-K-E.

5 I have two points.

6 One, keep Cochise County together.

7 Two concerns the congressional district.

8 I was very sad to see that most, if not all, of
9 the city of Tucson was included in our congressional
10 district. We are two vastly different entities. They are a
11 big city with big city problems, and we are ranchers and
12 rural and, and not from the same mind set.

13 We have enormous problems on the border. If
14 you're a rancher here, you carry a gun.

15 And that's sad that he's not protected by his own
16 government.

17 Every two years when our congressperson or people
18 are running for reelection, whether they're Republican or
19 Democrat, they come down on our border, put their arm around
20 a horse, and then tell us how much they love us.

21 And then they go back to Tucson and go back to
22 Washington, D.C., and nothing is every done.

23 (Applause.)

24 JIM BEHNKE: We need a representative, a
25 congressional representative from this area.

1 I recommend -- I think an ideal congressional
2 district would be the three counties of Cochise, Greenlee,
3 and Graham.

4 Thank you.

5 (Applause.)

6 COMMISSIONER McNULTY: Thank you, Mr. Behnke.

7 Charles Carlson.

8 Is Mr. Carlson here?

9 (No oral response.)

10 COMMISSIONER McNULTY: Sally Acevedo.

11 SALLY ACEVEDO: My name is Sally Acevedo,
12 A-C-E-V-E-D-O, from Sierra Vista, and Tom Crosby speaks for
13 me.

14 (Applause.)

15 SALLY ACEVEDO: I'm here once again to voice my
16 displeasure over the proposed districts the AIRC have put
17 forth for us here in Cochise County.

18 May I remind the Commission that pursuant to Davis
19 v. Bandemer, 478 US 109, from 1986, that gerrymandering is
20 unconstitutional.

21 The districts set forth clearly do not comply with
22 Arizona's state law, and I am left with little alternative
23 than to believe something nefarious is afoot.

24 What you have proposed is not even close to
25 reasonable, contiguous, nor do they follow federal voting

1 rights guidelines.

2 Cochise County has been deliberately divided so as
3 to reduce our voting power to suit an agenda.

4 We do not abide by sanctuary cities, preferring to
5 abide by our foundation as a constitutional republic and be
6 a nation of laws.

7 We are not a metropolitan region, enjoy our more
8 rural nature, our wild west heritage, low crime rates, and
9 the beauty of our Sky Islands, the San Pedro, and our
10 neighbors. Monument and Horseshoe proved we can take care
11 of one another far quicker and more efficiently than some
12 federal bureaucracy --

13 (Applause.)

14 SALLY ACEVEDO -- despite our differing political
15 opinions, which are usually very passionate.

16 Our industry consists of ranching, mining,
17 agriculture, tourism, our fort, along with government
18 agencies, which support our position as a border county.

19 Our leisure time is spent enjoying our forests
20 when not threatened or closed due to poor federal policy and
21 enforcement of laws, hunting, fishing, golfing, prospecting,
22 as well as the many opportunities to simply enjoy the beauty
23 of nature we have been blessed with.

24 Our neighbors are retirees, our military and their
25 families, government employees and contractors, snowbirds

1 and, yes, the dreaded Tea Party members.

2 You have made a mockery of the process of
3 redistricting with what you have presented.

4 Cochise would be more suited to, one, not be
5 divided, and, two, to include areas, perhaps Greenlee and
6 Graham Counties, east Santa Cruz, or perhaps even southeast
7 Pima.

8 Instead you have chosen to divvy us up, treating
9 us like a redheaded stepchild.

10 The other thing to note is the Hispanic Coalition
11 For Good Government who you seem to rely heavily upon.

12 I find it interesting the only place they be can
13 found other than newspaper articles is via talking points
14 put out on their behalf by the Sierra Club.

15 As a Latina, this group does not speak for me, but
16 it is appearing that it may speak for SEIU and MoveOn.org.

17 (Applause.)

18 COMMISSIONER McNULTY: Rick Dixon is our next
19 speaker.

20 And he will be followed by Donald Simpson and Dale
21 Stoner.

22 RICK DIXON: Good evening. That's Dixon,
23 D-I-X-O-N.

24 I just wanted to reiterate what's already been
25 spoken here tonight. I'm really displeased with what this

1 Commission has done so far.

2 This map is a joke.

3 Splitting counties like it is doesn't work for me.

4 And, again, I don't have five hours to drive to Flagstaff to
5 visit with a congressman.

6 Thank you.

7 COMMISSIONER McNULTY: Thank you, Mr. Dixon.

8 (Applause.)

9 COMMISSIONER McNULTY: Donald Simpson.

10 DONALD SIMPSON: Good evening. My name is
11 Dr. Donald Simpson, S-I-M-P-S-O-N. I practice dentistry in
12 Sierra Vista, for 36 years.

13 I certainly love Cochise County.

14 I appreciate your hard work, and I appreciate you
15 coming on down here. I know it's tough driving.

16 It's -- it is hard work.

17 You start out with a blank piece, but then you
18 came up with a nice county grid.

19 Why didn't you stick to that?

20 (Brief interruption.)

21 DONALD SIMPSON: Whether I look -- I looked at
22 this map, and I was agast.

23 I said, you know, the Proposition 106 said that
24 they wanted to get the politics out of redistricting. They
25 want to get rid of the shenanigans like gerrymandering.

1 We figured if we gave it to an independent
2 commission, that might happen.

3 They gave six -- you got six criteria.

4 Two are mandated by the federal government. The
5 judge will review those.

6 And you met those.

7 The next three, compactness and contiguousness, I
8 have to say, prima facie evidence is just look at the damn
9 map. It's not there.

10 And I -- excuse me for the language, but I am very
11 angry when I look at that map.

12 You did not respect communities of interest.

13 When you show that squiggly line that's
14 Cochise County, that just shows me you had a goal in mind.

15 You turned it around to get your so-called
16 competitiveness, which is a code word for let's elect more
17 Democrats.

18 Come on, face it, Arizona is a primarily
19 conservative state. I have voted for Democrats,
20 Libertarians, Republicans.

21 I vote for the person.

22 If they give me a good view, I don't care what
23 their party is.

24 And I find it horrible that you even look at party
25 affiliation until you've drawn a map.

1 Draw the map and then look and see if you've met
2 all the other criteria.

3 It's supposed to be subrogated to the other
4 criteria.

5 So, in short, you have failed. You failed in your
6 results. And from what I've heard rumor, you've failed in
7 the process.

8 Make it an open book.

9 Cochise County, there's no reason Cochise County
10 can't be in one congressional district. And there's no
11 reason it can't be in one legislative district.

12 Just make it closer to the grid maps.

13 And, again, I thank you for your work.

14 I just say, go back and look at what your mandate
15 is, and give us one whole county.

16 Thank you.

17 COMMISSIONER McNULTY: Thank you, Mr. Simpson.

18 (Applause.)

19 COMMISSIONER McNULTY: Dale Stoner, followed by
20 Wesley Webb and Steven Butler.

21 DALE STONER: Dale, D-A-L-E, S-T-O-N-E-R.

22 I would like to address the situation of the
23 proposed redistricting maps.

24 Number one, it is my opinion that they are a
25 violation of Proposition 106, then what I consider to be the

1 malaligned for a purpose of partisan advantage.

2 Number two, I see a violation of directives of the
3 constitution.

4 Number three, I see that we are disenfranchised
5 through thousands of legal voters by counting populations of
6 nonlegal voters.

7 (Applause.)

8 DALE STONER: I see a violation of open meeting
9 laws.

10 (Applause.)

11 DALE STONER: Because of the blatant disregard for
12 these violations, I do have a recommendation.

13 And my recommendation is to Tom Horne and our
14 honorable governor that they dismiss all five --

15 (Applause.)

16 DALE STONER: -- of the unelected, unaccountable
17 members of the Redistricting Commission and start over.

18 (Applause.)

19 COMMISSIONER McNULTY: Thank you, Mr. Stoner.

20 Wesley Webb? Is Wesley Webb here?

21 (No oral response.)

22 COMMISSIONER McNULTY: Steven Butler.

23 STEVEN BUTLER: Good evening. My name is Steven
24 Butler. I'm from Benson, Arizona. And I've lived here for
25 six years now.

1 I'm here on behalf of my wife who's ill, my
2 daughter and her husband who live over in Tombstone.

3 And we'd like to express our concerns about this
4 congressional redistricting map and the legislative map
5 that's being presented.

6 The San Pedro Valley is the, the -- and the
7 San Pedro River and the riparian area around it is the jewel
8 of Cochise County.

9 And it's one of the primary reasons why we settled
10 here.

11 And I was very disheartened -- my family was very
12 disheartened when we looked at the congressional draft map
13 and saw that our county was split right down the middle of
14 the San Pedro Valley along the river.

15 On one side we're blessed with the Chiricahua
16 Mountains and the Dragoon, and on the other side we have the
17 Whetstone and the Huachuca Mountains.

18 I can guaranty you that the congressional district
19 that stretches all the way to the Utah and Nevada borders up
20 there at the Grand Canyon could care less about our
21 San Pedro Valley down here.

22 And the other concern is on the legislative map.

23 I noticed that down on our -- down on the southern
24 border of the county, that Cochise County's economic engine
25 is the fort at Sierra Vista and the port at Douglas.

1 And I've noticed that the Redistricting Commission
2 has carved out the Douglas-Bisbee area and handed that over
3 to the area over in Sonoita.

4 And, again, their interests are not our interests
5 here in Cochise County, and I would strongly encourage the
6 Redistricting Commission to consider carving those out of
7 Cochise County and giving them back to us and unite the
8 county.

9 Thank you very much.

10 COMMISSIONER McNULTY: Thank you, Mr. Butler.

11 We have three more speakers.

12 The Pat Fleming, Jane Tilton, and MaryFrances
13 Clinton.

14 PAT FLEMING: Good evening, commissioners.
15 Welcome back to our wonderful Cochise County.

16 For the record, my name is Pat Fleming,
17 F-L-E-M-I-N-G.

18 I'm not here to lecture. You've certainly had
19 enough of that this evening. But I am here to offer some
20 constructive considerations and recommendations.

21 I'm also here this evening as an advocate for good
22 government, true legislative representation, and my
23 communities here in southeastern Arizona.

24 You've already been reminded after having
25 described what happened in November of 2000, where the

1 voters divided by citizens initiative the Proposition 106
2 voted to create you as a Commission.

3 I commend you for your efforts.

4 I know it's got to be very difficult to sit there
5 and be blasted on occasion, and I am very sorry you have to
6 sit there and do that.

7 We're charged here with drawing the new
8 congressional and state legislative districts, in accordance
9 with all of the descriptions that have already been read.

10 The current approved statewide legislative map is
11 the subject of my conversation tonight.

12 It's been specifically disfranchising our border
13 communities, those of Bisbee, Naco, Douglas, parts of
14 Hereford, and parts of Palominas.

15 Like so many others here in Cochise County, I feel
16 that Cochise County is in itself a community of interest.

17 We're proud of being rural and we're proud of our
18 various, various communities.

19 We respect the lines that define our schools --
20 our school and our fire districts.

21 Disturbing these districts is not in the best
22 interest of our citizens, and I fear that that is something
23 that is going to happen within the legislative district.

24 The current boundaries of LD 1 and LD 2 create
25 two major noncompetitive districts.

1 Specifically, LD now -- LD 1 now has a
2 16-point advantage in Republican registration, while LD 2,
3 an obviously packed minority-majority district, has a
4 26-point advantage for the Democratic registers.

5 Candidates from any party should be able to have
6 an equal chance at winning an election, and that's the voice
7 of competitiveness.

8 With some moderate modifications, those two huge
9 discrepancies could be somewhat remedied and at least close
10 some of the voter variances by keeping all of Cochise County
11 in the same legislative district. This will respect certain
12 distinctions such as the school districts and boundaries
13 that I already spoke about.

14 The packing of any new district is totally
15 inappropriate and disregards competitiveness.

16 LD 2, as it is now, has obviously been packed,
17 which it would be, of course, a violation of the
18 Voting Rights Act.

19 By giving our southern border communities of the
20 greater Bisbee, Naco, Douglas areas back into LD 1, we
21 certainly can help reduce some of that packing, and we will
22 allow it to be more compact and will make our Cochise County
23 reflect our community of interest.

24 Thank you for your attention, and have a safe
25 journey back.

1 COMMISSIONER McNULTY: Thank you, Ms. Fleming.

2 (Applause.)

3 COMMISSIONER McNULTY: Jane Tilton.

4 JANE TILTON: Thank you for allowing me to speak,
5 commissioners.

6 We're glad that you came to listen to us.

7 I don't have a lot of, you know, important
8 credentials. I'm just a citizen of this county.

9 My husband is a fifth generation native of
10 Cochise County. Some of his family on the other side
11 settled Graham County.

12 I grew up in Yuma and up in Coconino County.

13 And I can tell you, Yuma and Coconino County don't
14 have our interests at heart down here.

15 There is no way that they deal with the same
16 issues.

17 Their issues are serious, but particularly
18 Coconino County's interest, Navajo County's interest,
19 the other, the other -- Apache County, these are not our
20 issues.

21 We need to be represented in the legislature and
22 in congress.

23 We need Cochise County to stay together.

24 Our community of interest is small cities. It is
25 rural. It is agricultural. It is mining.

1 We fit much more with Graham County, Greenlee
2 County, perhaps the very easternmost parts of Pima, or
3 Santa Cruz County.

4 We do not fit with the northeastern portion of the
5 state.

6 Please keep Cochise County together. Please let
7 us be represented.

8 I'm not so concerned about competitiveness of
9 Republicans and Democrats as I am competitiveness of
10 Cochise County.

11 We need to be represented.

12 Believe me, if you put us with Tucson, and our
13 representative has to decide when there comes another base
14 closing, whether we -- they support the air base in Tucson
15 or Fort Huachuca, you can bet, with more voters in Tucson,
16 they're going to support that base, not Fort Huachuca.

17 We need to be represented. Please redraw that map
18 for us. Thank you for listening.

19 COMMISSIONER McNULTY: Thank you, Ms. Tilton.
20 MaryFrances Clinton.

21 MARYFRANCES CLINTON: Clinton? That's my bad
22 writing. My last name is Clinton, which most people can
23 spell now, even if I write it kind of funny. And my first
24 name, MaryFrances, is all one word with a capital F in the
25 middle.

1 You've heard what was my first reaction.

2 I live a third of a mile north of the border and a
3 third of the mile west of the San Pedro.

4 And I am being cut off from my community, which
5 goes back in my case to homestead times. 1903 is when my
6 family started there. And I live in the very same area,
7 just on the other side of the line of the original homestead
8 property.

9 So my feeling about my -- that the integrity of
10 the whole county of Cochise, which in those homestead times,
11 people went from town to town to town, because that's the
12 way they had to do business. And we still have that, that
13 kind of familiarity.

14 So I won't, I won't press that any more than
15 to just give that personal sense of reality of our
16 community.

17 Would you -- I will forgive you for missing that,
18 because we were a long ways away and maybe we didn't look
19 like we counted, but I know you know we do now.

20 The second thing I want to say is that we proved
21 our competitiveness in the last election.

22 Gabrielle Giffords did win that election, but not
23 because there was some sort of equal thought by everybody
24 all the same.

25 But more importantly, even when we disagree, we

1 have a sense of common interest that maybe we look at it
2 from this angle or from that angle, but even in my community
3 of Palominas where we're very strongly divided, or maybe
4 united, I don't know if I would be the only one who isn't a
5 Tea Party member, but the fact of the matter is I have many
6 Tea Party friends, and we have a sense of community.

7 So across the lines of political and special
8 interest, there's a wholeness here that I think you now know
9 is important.

10 The last thing I want to say is I realize you have
11 a very difficult job, and I wouldn't trade skins with you.
12 I hope yours are much thicker than mine. And I apologize
13 that some people feel that it's okay to just attack without
14 any other consideration.

15 I appreciate your sense of duty, your fiduciary
16 responsibility, and your awareness of it, and the difficulty
17 of all the special interests and difficult powers that you
18 have to deal with.

19 Thank you for coming down.

20 COMMISSIONER McNULTY: Thank you, Ms. Clinton.

21 That's our last speaker form.

22 Is there anyone that we've missed that turned in a
23 speaker form?

24 (No oral response.)

25 COMMISSIONER McNULTY: Okay. I want to thank you

1 for taking the time to give us your thoughts tonight.

2 We have a tradition that we share the mic with our
3 fellow commissioners, so I'll turn it over now to Mr. Stertz
4 for any closing words that he'd like to make.

5 COMMISSIONER STERTZ: Thank you.

6 I want to tell you how incredibly impressed --
7 thank you. I want to tell you how incredibly impressed I am
8 with the turnout tonight here in Sierra Vista, people coming
9 all the way from Globe and coming down.

10 I first started coming to Sierra Vista because my
11 brother right after college moved to Sierra Vista to work at
12 the newspaper here, and then he moved down to Douglas.

13 So I've been a longtime visitor of Sierra Vista
14 and Douglas.

15 I lost my brother in 1995 to cancer. So, he was,
16 he was known for breaking the Hannigan story years ago.

17 I want to tell you how impressed I was at the new
18 ideas that came out tonight, how passionate there was --
19 that there was a lot of passion on both sides, and there was
20 a lot of food for thought that was given.

21 We've got, I believe, 10 more or 11 more public
22 hearings that we're going to be having. Then the 30 days
23 will be closed and the Commission will be doing a lot of
24 hard work.

25 And trust me, we'll be listening to every word

1 that was said tonight.

2 So thank you very, very much for coming out
3 tonight.

4 (Applause.)

5 COMMISSIONER McNULTY: Thank you for spending the
6 evening with us.

7 This is a complicated job, and I want to thank our
8 staff. You can rest assured that whatever your concerns are
9 about the work that we're doing, we're working hard, and we
10 have a fabulous staff.

11 And I particularly want to thank Mr. Herder for
12 hanging in there so that we could allow everyone to speak
13 and allow you to get home before it's too late.

14 So, with that, I'll call the meeting adjourned at
15 8:37 p.m.

16 (Whereupon, the meeting adjourned.)

17

18

19

* * * * *

20

21

22

23

24

25

1 STATE OF ARIZONA)
)
2 COUNTY OF MARICOPA) ss.

3

4 BE IT KNOWN that the foregoing proceeding was
5 taken before me, Marty Herder, a Certified Court Reporter,
6 CCR No. 50162, State of Arizona; that the foregoing
7 107 pages constitute a true and accurate transcript of all
8 proceedings had upon the taking of said meeting, all done to
9 the best of my skill and ability.

10 DATED at Chandler, Arizona, this 28th day of
11 October, 2011.

12

13

14

C. Martin Herder, CCR
Certified Court Reporter
Certificate No. 50162

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25