

THE STATE OF ARIZONA
INDEPENDENT REDISTRICTING COMMISSION

REPORTER'S TRANSCRIPT OF LISTENING TOUR PUBLIC MEETING

Avondale, Arizona

Pinetop, Arizona

Online via WebEx

November 30, 2021

6:00 p.m.

Miller Certified Reporting, LLC
PO Box 513, Litchfield Park, AZ 85340
(P) 623-975-7472 (F) 623-975-7462
www.MillerCertifiedReporting.com

Reported By:
Angela Furniss Miller, RPR
Certified Reporter (AZ 50127)

Miller Certified Reporting, LLC

1 LISTENING TOUR PUBLIC MEETING, BEFORE THE
 2 INDEPENDENT REDISTRICTING COMMISSION, convened at 6:00 p.m.
 3 on November 30, 2021, at Avondale City Council Chambers,
 4 11465 West Civic Center Drive, Avondale, Arizona; with a
 5 satellite location at Hon-Dah Casino Conference Center, 777
 6 AZ-260, Pinetop, Arizona; and online via WebEx.

7
 8 COMMISSIONER PRESENT:

9 Ms. Shereen Lerner

10 COMMISSIONERS PRESENT VIA VIDEOCONFERENCE:

11 Ms. Erika Neuberg, Chairperson
 12 Mr. Derrick Watchman, Vice Chairman
 13 Mr. David Mehl

14 STAFF PRESENT:

15 Mr. Brian Schmitt, Executive Director
 16 Ms. Loriandra Van Haren, Deputy Director
 17 Ms. Valerie Neumann, Executive Assistant
 18 Ms. Michele Crank, Public Information Officer
 19 Mr. Alex Pena, Public Outreach Coordinator
 20 Ms. Marie Camacho, Public Outreach Coordinator
 21 Mr. Mark Flahan, Timmons Group

22 PUBLIC COMMENT SPEAKERS:

<u>SPEAKER NAME:</u>	<u>LOCATION</u>
Gwendena Lee-Gatewood	Pinetop
Aubrey Aday	Pinetop
Dawnafe Whitesinger	Pinetop
Bryon Lewis	Pinetop
Patrick Day	Pinetop
Arnold Beach	Pinetop
KeAloha Douma	Pinetop
Casey Douma	Pinetop
Eric Kramer	Pinetop
Sheryl Eaton	Pinetop

1 PUBLIC COMMENT SPEAKERS (continued):

2	<u>SPEAKER NAME:</u>	<u>LOCATION</u>
3	Jody Inman	Pinetop
	Missa Foy	Pinetop
4	Virginia Dotson	Pinetop
	Daryl Seymore	Pinetop
5	Daniel Schwartz	Avondale
	Ulysses Correa	Avondale
6	Gisell Garcia	Avondale
	Martin Nowakowski	Avondale
7	Clair Van Steenwyk	Avondale
	Beatrice Bouda	Avondale
8	Alexis Delgado Garcia	Avondale
	Ivonne Dominguez	Avondale
9	Annette Alvarez	Avondale
	Maribel Ponci	Avondale
10	Kodee Goseyun	Pinetop
	Kimberly Whitley	Pinetop
11	Jesse Chanley	Pinetop
	Lisa Green	Pinetop
12	Sylvia Allen	Pinetop
	Louise Liggett	Pinetop
13	Jerry Hubbard	Pinetop
	Jandi Craig	Pinetop
14	Mary Ann Joseph	Pinetop
	Randy Ruthier	Pinetop
15	Marian Quintero	Pinetop
	Holly Hanson	Pinetop
16	Dave Berry	Pinetop
	Lynn Peters	Avondale
17	Trey Terry	Avondale
	Athena Stuart	Avondale
18	Lan Hoang	Avondale
	Jeff Specter	Avondale
19	Summer Baker	Avondale
	Richard Hopkins	Avondale
20	Lisa Sung	Avondale
	Chris Schultz	Avondale
21	Unidentified Speaker	Avondale
	Natacha Chavez	Avondale
22	Sandra Dowling	Avondale
	Jordi Santos	Avondale
23	Monica Ortiz	Avondale
	Max White	Avondale

24 *

25 American Sign language interpreters, Spanish interpreters, and an Apache Interpreter are present.

P R O C E E D I N G

1
2
3 VICE CHAIR WATCHMAN: (Technical/audio disruption)
4 White Mountain Apaches, and so thank you for joining us.

5 We're here in Pinetop and we also have a -- a
6 second meeting going on or a second -- we're streaming at
7 Avondale and so we're streaming this on WebEx and it will be
8 posted online via YouTube to have a chance to look at it if
9 you don't get it all today.

10 In Pinetop we're under the jurisdiction of the
11 tribal government so you're required to follow the laws of
12 the tribe which includes wearing a mask at all times, that
13 is a tribal mask mandate here on the Reservation. So thank
14 you for your consideration.

15 In Avondale, for those of you who are in Avondale,
16 we ask you to follow the Arizona Department of Health
17 guidelines regarding COVID-19. If you're not fully
18 vaccinated you should wear a mask in public space.

19 If you'd like to make a public comment, you may do
20 so by signing in with staff and filling out a public
21 comments card which I think most of you have already done.
22 Even though this meeting will begin at 6:00 p.m., anyone can
23 attend and submit a public speaking card at any time during
24 the meeting and we will do our best to accommodate you.

25 There is going to be an American Sign Language

1 interpreter and we're also transcribing the proceedings.
2 Please speak clearly and slowly so that we can include your
3 name and all the information for the record.

4 At this time I would like to introduce my
5 colleagues on the Commission. I'll start to my immediate
6 left here.

7 CHAIRPERSON NEUBERG: Hello, my name is Erika
8 Neuberg and I'm the Chairwoman, a registered Independent,
9 and I live in Chandler.

10 VICE CHAIR WATCHMAN: And I see Commissioner Mehl.
11 I think you're on mute, sir.

12 COMMISSIONER MEHL: Sorry about that. My name is
13 David Mehl and I'm the Commissioner from Pima County and I
14 appreciate all of you attending tonight. Thank you.

15 VICE CHAIR WATCHMAN: Thank you, Commissioner Mehl.
16 Anybody else?

17 Okay. We have two others that should be joining us
18 and when they do we'll have them introduce themselves.

19 Like I said I'm Derrick Watchman, the
20 Vice Chairman. I'm the Democratic appointee and I represent
21 Apache County, and I come from Window Rock, Arizona. So
22 thank you.

23 Now I'd like to move on to Item No. II on the
24 agenda and staff will read the rules of the meeting.

25 Staff.

1 MS. VAN HAREN: (Technical/audio disruption)
2 additionally, speakers are required to follow proper decorum
3 and must use appropriate --

4 MS. NEUMANN: Excuse me. We're not able to hear
5 the rules here in Avondale. If you could repeat those.

6 MS. VAN HAREN: Okay. I believe you guys can hear
7 us now. I apologize. I'm going to have to start over.

8 Citizens may only speak when recognized by the
9 Chair or the presiding officer of the meeting if the Chair
10 is absent or otherwise has delegated hearing administration
11 authority.

12 In compliance with Arizona's open meeting law,
13 speakers should confine their comments and statements to the
14 issue on the posted agenda which is before the Commission.

15 Speakers are also requested to limit their comments
16 to approximately two minutes.

17 In an effort to allow for as many speakers as
18 possible, the Commission may adjust the time limits
19 depending on the amount of speakers requesting to be heard.

20 Additionally, speakers are required to follow
21 proper decorum. Speakers must use appropriate language.
22 Foul and/or abusive language will not be tolerated. Any
23 speaker failing to follow proper decorum or any other
24 guidelines may be asked to leave. Any breach of the peace
25 or disruption of the Commission public hearing may be cause

1 of report to law enforcement.

2 If someone has already expressed the same sentiment
3 you wish to express, you may say so and your comments will
4 be recorded. If you have already expressed your thoughts at
5 a previous meeting, you do not need to speak again. Your
6 comments were recorded in the public record.

7 This is a nonpartisan meeting. Please do not
8 distribute political material in the meeting room.

9 Opposing viewpoints may be expressed by the
10 citizens present. As a courtesy, citizens are reminded to
11 address their comments to the Chair and the Commission and
12 not to the audience present. Please show respect for all
13 speakers and avoid personal comments.

14 Remember, the Commission must hear all sides of the
15 issue in order to make an informed decision.

16 At this time we will now begin public comment.

17 MS. CRANK: Good evening, Madam Chair and Vice
18 Chair and members of the Commission and the listening
19 audience. We're going to start with the introduction of our
20 Apache interpreter.

21 APACHE INTERPRETER: Yes, good evening. My name is
22 Shawn Sanchez and I'll just be interpreting English to
23 Apache and Apache to English.

24 (Apache language spoken.)

25 MS. CRANK: He does speak Apache, honest. So okay.

1 I'd like to first introduce the Honorable Gwendena
2 Lee-Gatewood who is the chairman of the White Mountain
3 Apache. Madam Chair.

4 (Applause.)

5 SPEAKER LEE-GATEWOOD: I just asked her if I should
6 speak in Apache and will everyone understand what I'm saying
7 here tonight.

8 Okay.

9 (Apache language spoken.)

10 Good evening, Honorable Chairwoman, Vice Chairman
11 and Commissioners, my name is Gwendena Lee-Gatewood. I'm
12 the tribal chairwoman of this great White Mountain Apache
13 Tribe. Welcome to the Fort Apache Indian Reservation.
14 Thank you for accepting our request to host a meeting here,
15 for the people here and the people of the White Mountain
16 community.

17 Our tribe covers over 1.6 million acres with a
18 population of over 17,000 and growing. As a sovereign
19 tribal nation, providing services to our people is of great
20 importance. It's so crucial that the tribe be in a healthy
21 Native American majority district in order to elect a
22 candidate of our choice. The White Mountain Apache tribe
23 requests to maintain the districts as close to the current
24 maps as probable, meaning the legislative and congressional
25 maps adopted in January of 2012.

1 The tribe's reservation currently sits within
2 Arizona's Legislative District 7, Congressional District 2,
3 within Navajo, Apache, and Gila county. It's important to
4 the White Mountain Apache tribe to be in a district with
5 communities that share our same interests, values and life
6 experiences; it's a part of our history, it's ancestral to
7 who we are as the White Mountain community actually, and we
8 want to ensure that our people that live in the neighboring
9 towns like Springerville, Pinetop, Lakeside and Show Low --
10 I grew up in Show Low, by the way, when -- that -- they're
11 not cut out from the district as they currently are on the
12 latest proposed map.

13 By including surrounding communities of interest
14 into a district that contains the White Mountain Apache
15 tribe, we wish to maintain a high Native American
16 percentage; therefore, other non-Native American
17 communities, preferably like Flagstaff, should be placed
18 into neighboring districts. To balance the population and
19 maintain a high Native American population is needed and
20 this would bring in our neighboring communities of
21 interest -- Pinetop, Lakeside, Show Low, Springerville --
22 where our Apache Native American people live, go to school,
23 shop and the economy.

24 It's important that we're able to elect a leader, a
25 candidate of choice, to ensure that our voices are heard and

1 it's our hope that the Commission hears the voice of the
2 White Mountain Apache tribe and works to preserve and
3 maintain the current Legislative District 7 and
4 Congressional District 2.

5 Thank you.

6 (Apache language spoken.)

7 VICE CHAIR WATCHMAN: Thank you.

8 MS. CRANK: Thank you, Madam Chair. The next
9 speakers -- and I'm going to be naming off the next ten
10 speakers, so if you can just kind of line up against that
11 wall as I call your name.

12 The next speaker is a member of the White Mountain
13 Apache Tribal Council, Aubrey Aday, and then Navajo County
14 Supervisor Dawnafe Whitesinger, councilman from Snowflake
15 Byron Lewis, Patrick Day, Eric Kramer, Cheryl Eaton, Jodi
16 Inman, Missa Foy, Virginia Dotson, Daryl Seymore.

17 Councilman Aday.

18 SPEAKER ADAY: Want to say a few words in Apache
19 introduction.

20 (Apache language spoken.)

21 Hi, my name is -- good evening, my name is Aubrey
22 Aday. I'm one of the Council District 3 representatives.

23 As the Chairwoman Lee-Gatewood stated, it is
24 important as a tribe to ensure that we are in a healthy
25 Native American majority district. The White Mountain

1 Apache understand that race cannot consider a factor in
2 redistricting, but as you're aware, the Voting Rights Act of
3 1965 provides opportunity to create Native American majority
4 districts if certain requirements are met. These
5 requirements set forth in *Thornburg vs. Gingles* are clearly
6 met.

7 As to the first criteria, there is enough minority
8 population to create majority-minority district using the
9 current map adopted in 2012.

10 This area covers all or part of the reservation of
11 the White Mountain Apache, San Carlos tribe, Navajo Nation,
12 and the Hopi tribe.

13 Second, history has shown that these tribal nation
14 vote as a bloc as we support similar issues across
15 candidates.

16 Last, it should also show that pattern exists as a
17 majority voting against Native American preferred candidate.

18 Because all three factors of the *Gingles* test are
19 met, the opportunity to create Native American majority
20 district is satisfied.

21 It is important to the White Mountain Apache tribe
22 to be in a district with the community that share our same
23 interests, values and life experience, being in this type of
24 community of interest of other Native American tribes such
25 as those that speak the same language.

1 Thank you.

2 SPEAKER WHITESINGER: Good evening. I'm Dawnafe
3 Whitesinger, Navajo County Board of Supervisors. I'm here
4 to speak on behalf of my family, my children, and those I
5 represent. Thank you to all of you on the Independent
6 Redistricting committee for taking the time to serve Arizona
7 and to do this important and thankless work sometimes,
8 right?

9 I know that the task ahead of you is quite
10 difficult and I am requesting that you reconsider the draft
11 maps that make -- and make needed changes that make the
12 districts more competitive and create a balanced opportunity
13 for all communities to have appropriate representation.

14 The current draft maps will force tribes to be
15 ignored and further marginalized. The proposed maps will
16 muffle the needs of tribal communities and silence the
17 advocacy needed for tribes.

18 Tribes deserve to be fairly represented and have
19 the ability to choose the representation that best align
20 with the needs of the people.

21 Our tribal nations, just as our neighboring
22 communities, are integral to the fabric of Arizona and these
23 maps do not represent that.

24 I support the congressional map submitted by the
25 Navajo Nation Human Rights Commission CD0101 and the map

1 submitted by the Navajo -- or the Coconino County Board of
2 Supervisors.

3 We have come a long way as Native Americans in
4 voting -- voter participation. The past election cycle,
5 over 60 percent of eligible tribal voters voted. We have
6 not seen this in -- historically in the past, and this --
7 redistricting is important.

8 It is imperative to protecting constitutional
9 rights of Native Americans since the voting margin changed
10 from 7 percent and made for more competitive to give tribes
11 the opportunity to elect individuals that will advocate for
12 the interests of all communities.

13 Thank you.

14 SPEAKER LEWIS: Good evening. Thank you for your
15 time and attendance. We wish you Godspeed on your journey.
16 Decisions that you-all are going to make will be impactful
17 and important and affect the lives of thousands of people
18 across this area of Northern Arizona.

19 I'm a sixth generation Arizonan, born and bred. My
20 family were the original settlers out of Moenkopi. My
21 grandmother was born the year before Arizona became a state,
22 lived to be 103.

23 I represent the voice of many of the constituents
24 in Snowflake where I have the honor to serve as a city
25 council member who have shared their concerns about these

1 maps and -- and the redistricting affects the way of life
2 that we have here.

3 We have a rich heritage as well, one of mining,
4 farming, ranching we would like to see preserved.

5 With all due respect to the Native American
6 population here who deserve their own voice, as do urban,
7 rural voice has not been heard effectively since 2011 when
8 the redistricting originally took place.

9 I would encourage you to keep Flagstaff in LD-6.
10 They do not share the same values, they do not share the
11 same political outcomes, the same geographic demographics,
12 or the same outlooks, and I don't think they have the same
13 vision for Arizona.

14 Another situation for the Commission to take into
15 effect has been the topic that has been debated for the last
16 60 years and may go on for another hundred, and that's water
17 adjudication. There's a significant difference between
18 those who are seeking to acquire water and those who are
19 seeking to preserve it. By allowing each of these
20 constituencies to have their own representation and their
21 own voice, you can bring a more equitable solution to this
22 problem that have been vexing all cultures in this area.

23 Thank you; and, again, I wish you Godspeed on your
24 journeys. Safe travels. I know you'd rather be here --
25 rather be anywhere else than here just about right now.

1 VICE CHAIR WATCHMAN: Thank you.

2 SPEAKER DAY: Good evening, I'm Patrick Day. I
3 live in an unincorporated area of Apache County near Concho.
4 I'm speaking for myself and family who own property in
5 Apache County.

6 I'm an Independent-minded voter who believes the
7 congressional districts should be competitive. The current
8 configuration of District 1 makes it a competitive district
9 that exceeds the Commission's standard for competitiveness,
10 a maximum 7 percent -- percent spread.

11 Competitive districts encourage candidates to
12 address the needs and concerns of all voters not just the
13 conserva- -- not just the majority party. The IRC's draft
14 map of Congressional District 2 takes a highly competitive
15 district and puts it solidly in the camp of one party, as
16 evidenced by the IRC's test races. This anticompetitive
17 imbalance is unnecessary to meet the requirements of the
18 other five congressional criteria.

19 The congressional draft map submitted by the
20 Navajo Nation maintains competition in Congressional
21 District 2 as well as meeting all other criteria. I urge
22 the Commission to redraw the lines for CD-2.

23 Thank you.

24 MS. CRANK: At this time I would also like to
25 introduce to come up to the podium and speak, one of White

1 Mountain Apache Tribal Council members, Arnold Beach.

2 SPEAKER BEACH: Good evening, Commissioners. My
3 name is Arnold Beach, White Mountain Apache Tribal Council.
4 Been serving the tribe in this capacity for 15 years; prior
5 to this 20 years in law enforcement.

6 White Mountain -- White Mountain Apache tribe
7 understand that race cannot be considered a factor in
8 redistricting. It is important to White Mountain Apache
9 tribe to be in a district with community that share the same
10 interests, values and life experiences. Being in this type
11 of community of interest with other Native American tribes
12 such as those that speak the same language, communities that
13 have the same history as the White Mountain Apache tribe,
14 and communities that the White Mountain Apache tribe have
15 collaborated and partnered with throughout the years
16 provides the tribe with an increased opportunity to ensure
17 proper representation to the tribe on both the federal and
18 state level.

19 It is also our hope that the Commission works to
20 preserve and maintain Legislative District 7 and
21 Congressional District 2.

22 I thank you for your time and I do appreciate this
23 time. Thank you very much.

24 MS. CRANK: I'm sorry, Erika.

25 Also at this time I would like to introduce White

1 Mountain Apache Attorney General KeAloha Douma. KeAloha
2 Douma.

3 SPEAKER DOUMA: Hi, good evening. My name is
4 KeAloha Douma, White Mountain Apache tribe Attorney General
5 as well as a proud member of the White Mountain Apache
6 tribe.

7 I echo what Chairwoman Lee-Gatewood stated as well
8 as our councilman -- Councilman Aubrey Aday, as well as the
9 Councilman Arnold Beach.

10 The tribe wants to preserve a district as close to
11 the map as currently -- as they currently are as possible.
12 We want to ensure that we have zealous representation. We
13 want to have a Native American minority population -- we do
14 have a Native American minority population that deserves to
15 have proper representation.

16 Redistricting has, of course, the ability to
17 positively or negatively impact our government, our people,
18 our resources, future resources and the responsiveness of
19 our representatives. That is extremely important to the
20 White Mountain Apache tribe.

21 As the Commission is aware, a low Native American
22 percentage means, meaning below 60 percent, could mean a
23 dilution of the Native American vote and the inability of
24 Native Americans to elect a candidate of choice.

25 The tribe opposes modifications that would

1 negatively impact the tribe's ability to elect a candidate
2 of choice. As the Chairwoman was stating, we want to ensure
3 that the neighboring towns where our people also live are in
4 the same legislative and congressional districts as the
5 people located on the White Mountain Apache Reservation.

6 Along with many other Apache and Native American
7 families, I work in White River, I live in Pinetop, my
8 children go to school in Lakeside. Along with my other
9 fellow tribal members, we shop in Show Low and all the other
10 surrounding communities here in the White Mountain. The
11 White Mountain Apache tribe is a strong driving force for
12 the economy here and we employ a -- a significant number of
13 people from the neighboring communities.

14 As to the congressional map, we would like to see
15 Prescott moved into another district. We feel strongly that
16 they're not a community of interest with the White Mountain
17 Apache tribe, they do not share the same values that are
18 important to us. It is important to us that we are able to
19 elect a candidate of our choice. My cousin that spoke
20 earlier, Dawnafe Whitesinger, Navajo County Supervisor, she
21 also lives in a neighboring community like myself.

22 It's important for us to be able to elect someone
23 that -- like her that shares our same interests, our same
24 values and will be able to give us that important zealous
25 representation that the White Mountain Apache tribe

1 requires, desires, and demands.

2 Thank you.

3 MS. CRANK: Also White Mountain Apache tribal
4 representative Casey Douma.

5 SPEAKER DOUMA: Thank you.

6 Good evening, Madam Chair, Chair, Vice Chair and
7 honorable committee members, my name is Casey Douma. I am a
8 representative of White Mountain Apache tribe as well as a
9 resident of Pinetop, Arizona.

10 And the -- the importance of securing districts
11 that empower Native American voters is very important. So
12 when we look at the Voting Rights Act and the ability to
13 secure a Native American majority district, we see that, as
14 been discussed earlier, the factors that allow the
15 Commission to design a Native American majority district
16 within the legislative districts, those factors are met, the
17 *Gingles* factors.

18 Importantly, one of the very important aspects of
19 having a Native American majority district is to look at
20 historical disenfranchisement of Native American voters
21 within the area. If we look at the history of
22 disenfranchisement, we see that there's a definite need to
23 secure the voting power and -- and strengthen the voting
24 power of Native Americans.

25 We see that when Section 5 of the Voting Rights Act

1 was gutted by the United States Supreme Court, we now have
2 this void with a lot of attempts to dilute the
3 Native American voting power to make it more difficult to
4 vote, so securing strong Native American majority districts
5 is very important to the White Mountain Apache people as
6 well as Native Americans within the district.

7 And so we begin to look at the factors that allow
8 the majority Native American districts to be created, it is
9 imper- -- imperative that -- that the voice of the White
10 Mountain Apache leadership is factored in, as in defining
11 those communities of interest, the White Mountain Apache
12 leadership is in the best -- best situation, the best place
13 to define what is a community of interest for the White
14 Mountain Apache people.

15 And so with that, I'd like to thank you for your
16 efforts in pushing and advocating, wish to carry the voices
17 of the White Mountain Apache people into the respective
18 decisions that you have today.

19 Thank you.

20 MS. CRANK: Eric.

21 SPEAKER KRAMER: I am Eric Kramer from Pinetop. An
22 approximately equal number of noncompetitive districts is
23 not the same thing as competitive districts required by the
24 Arizona Constitution.

25 Native Americans are told that they will be all

1 right in the proposed CD-2 because as a 22 percent minority
2 they will have influence. Those assurances are not credible
3 when the district is likely to be controlled by actual white
4 supremacists. Gosar is a white supremacist and he created
5 an image of himself killing a nonwhite woman for sport, he
6 shouldn't be given Northern Arizona as a personal fief.

7 We need the portions of Yavapai County beyond
8 Mingus Mountain to be removed from Congressional District 2
9 to make it competitive. The legislative districts in
10 northeast Arizona are not competitive and violate the
11 charter of the Commission. Packing is as much a form of
12 gerrymandering as splitting.

13 Native Americans are packed into the new LD-6 along
14 with much of Flagstaff. This gives three Natives
15 24,000-a-year jobs in Phoenix, but when they get there they
16 aren't even allowed in the room when the budget is
17 discussed. The gerrymander packs Northern Arizona's
18 Democrats into a single district and leaves the 300,000
19 Native Americans without any hope of meaningful influence in
20 state government.

21 Competitive legislative districts can be provided
22 by following the Coconino County Board of Supervisors plan.

23 Thank you.

24 SPEAKER EATON: Sheryl Eaton, Navajo County outside
25 Lakeside. We are here on the sovereign nation of the White

1 Mountain Apaches where I lived and/or worked for 35 years.

2 Competitiveness and fairness of districts are the
3 specific redistricting requirements the people of Arizona
4 voted for in 2000. The current CD-1 is competitive.

5 Candidates have to work hard to win it and have to listen to
6 and represent all of their constituents to be re-elected.

7 Voters of all parties work to get out the vote and
8 Native American votes can make the difference.

9 The draft CD-2 map is not competitive. Republicans
10 win test elections nine out of nine times. That eliminates
11 the power of the Native American vote, they would have
12 22 percent of the votes in the district but no chance of
13 electing their candidates and the elected representative
14 could just ignore them. The representative would only have
15 to cater to his or her base to get re-elected every time.
16 To give all people the chance to effect the outcome of an
17 election, the margin between political parties should be
18 quite small, maybe 3 percent.

19 I support the Navajo Human Rights Commission's
20 proposed map for CD-2, CDF010 because it creates a
21 competitive district.

22 As to legislative districts, my comment is similar.
23 A bright blue district next to a bright red district
24 discourages people from participating. Why try when you
25 know you will lose or when you know you will surely win?

1 The outcome is predetermined by the boundaries of the
2 districts.

3 I favor the Coconino County Supervisors' proposed
4 maps for the new LD-6 and 7.

5 For the last 150 to 500 years Native Americans have
6 fought literally and figuratively to preserve their lands,
7 their languages, their cultures and their lives. They
8 deserve to have a fighting chance to be able to help choose
9 their preferred candidates and even win a couple elections.

10 Appreciate the work of the -- of the Commission and
11 I wish you well in devising fair and competitive maps.

12 Thank you.

13 SPEAKER INMAN: Good evening, Honorable Chairwoman
14 and Commissioners.

15 My name is Jody Inman, I live in Pinetop. I
16 recognize that I am standing on Apache land. I am thankful
17 that I was able to live and teach here and in Show Low. My
18 sons graduated from Alchesay High School in White River and
19 are still in touch with their Apache friends. I'm retired
20 now but hope to be here until my last breath.

21 In the 34 years I've lived in the White Mountains,
22 I've seen the relationship between the Apache and
23 Navajo Nations in their culture, family ties and economy,
24 along with the towns in eastern Arizona that serve us all in
25 traverse and commerce.

1 I ask that you support the congressional draft map
2 proposed by the Navajo Nation Human Rights Commission,
3 CDF010, to protect these historical ties.

4 The current map proposal for CD-2 could disrupt
5 these communities of interest, are not compact in our area,
6 and are not competitive in ideology. We have little in
7 common with Prescott and Yavapai County if they were brought
8 into our district.

9 So again, I ask you to please support CDF010 of the
10 Navajo Nation map proposal. Keep the lines as close to the
11 present boundaries as possible and thanks for being here for
12 us.

13 SPEAKER FOY: Good evening, everyone. My name is
14 Missa Foy and I live here in Navajo County. I'm here to
15 voice my concern about the congressional draft maps.

16 CD-2 took a highly competitive district and turned
17 it into a noncompetitive district. In the nine sample races
18 used, the one party won all nine of those races. The vote
19 spread in the district is over 7 percent, which is simply
20 too high. The district is not competitive and that didn't
21 need to happen in order to accommodate the other
22 constitutional criteria. In a district as large and as
23 diverse as CD-2, ensuring competitiveness and wholeness of
24 communities of interest is key so that all constituents get
25 the representation they deserve.

1 In Navajo County we have more opportunities and
2 challenges in common with Greenlee and Graham Counties than
3 we do with Prescott and we would be better served to have
4 those counties in our district.

5 We need to work together to find solutions to the
6 unique problems we face in northeast Arizona. To have this
7 kind of solidarity, a district must be competitive so
8 elected officials need to work for every constituent.

9 CD-2 as drawn is currently 22 percent
10 Native American and most Native Americans vote as a bloc.
11 If the current map is adopted, they will have no say in who
12 ultimately wins the election. This election will be decided
13 in the primary. This kind of inequity should not be
14 supported; additionally, Independent voters will be
15 disenfranchised because of the low primary turnout.

16 A small minority of voters will be choosing a
17 representative for an area that covers more than half of the
18 state. This inequitable situation can be avoided. This
19 Commission can redraw CD-2 and use the map submitted by the
20 Navajo Nation. It 's map CDF010. This map has a less than
21 1 percent vote spread and includes the counties of Graham
22 and Greenlee. This ensures that the best candidate will win
23 the election and that is a win for all of us in CD-2.

24 Thank you very much, Commissioners; and thank you,
25 White Mountain Apache tribe for hosting.

1 SPEAKER DOTSON: Good evening. I'm Virginia Dotson
2 from Vernon in Apache County.

3 These draft maps violate my community of interest.
4 First, we don't belong in any Copper Corridor; here we do
5 tourism and outdoor recreation.

6 Next, we're a border community. We have to get
7 along with a diversity of people, the tourists and our
8 Native American neighbors who come here from nearby towns to
9 go to school, work, shop, and hold county offices.

10 The maps you have drafted for both CD-2 and LD-7
11 reach across the state to merge us with areas such as
12 Prescott and western Yavapai County where extreme
13 nationalism has taken hold.

14 This does not fit our community.

15 Draft CD-2 does bring 13 tribal nations together
16 but then cancels out their votes with lots of extreme right
17 voters.

18 This is a parody of the Voting Rights Act. Tribal
19 members will never be able to elect candidates of their
20 choice as it stands.

21 CD-2 does not even meet your own broad standard for
22 competitiveness. In closely divided Arizona, a 7 percent
23 advantage is a landslide.

24 I urge you to adopt the map CDF010 from the Navajo
25 Human Rights Commission. It is competitive and keeps our

1 community of interest together.

2 I ask you to replace your Northern Arizona
3 legislative maps with those drawn by the Coconino County
4 Board of Supervisors, map LDF050 for LD-7 and map LDF051 for
5 LD-6.

6 Thank you very much.

7 MS. CRANK: Supervisor Daryl Seymore?

8 We don't have Daryl Seymore here, so we'll -- oh
9 he's behind me.

10 SPEAKER SEYMORE: Good evening. I'm grateful for
11 the Tribal Chairwoman hosting this tonight.

12 Commissioners, I'm Daryl Seymore. I was the mayor
13 of city of Show Low for eight years, have been a county
14 supervisor for the past two.

15 Wherever you draw a line you're going to cause
16 contention. You're going to cause boundaries. I think
17 that's one of the great things that we have in our community
18 here is we're a community that works together, we're a
19 community that -- that thrives.

20 That when a tribe is successful, the White Mountain
21 Apache tribe is successful, they do business, they do things
22 in -- in the city of Show Low, but yet their values are
23 probably different than those of the Navajo Nation and so
24 you have that issue.

25 How do you really help the Navajo Nation be heard

1 as well as the White Mountain Apache tribe be heard because
2 they have different values and different principles? Yet we
3 all work together. We're here in White Mountain; we're here
4 in Navajo County. We're trying to make the best that we
5 can.

6 And I think we need to look at what's best for the
7 people, how we're best represented -- our farmers, our
8 loggers, our ranchers. That's the history of this state
9 that needs to be preserved. We will go back to those days
10 of raising cattle, raising sheep, having farms, being
11 self-sufficient and loving our neighbors; and if we can do
12 that and continue to work together, I think you guys can do
13 better than what you proposed to us so far.

14 And we just hope that you-all listen and keep the
15 people that want to be together, together so their voice can
16 be heard. We have not had a voice of rural Arizona for
17 years. I've gone down to the state capitol many times and
18 our representatives aren't even there because we do not have
19 the same values and principles.

20 May you help us have a voice so we can be heard the
21 same as everyone.

22 Thank you.

23 MS. CRANK: At this time we'll take -- send it over
24 to Avondale.

25 MS. NEUMANN: Thank you. Good evening. At this

1 time we'd like to introduce Commissioner Lerner.

2 COMMISSIONER LERNER: Good evening, everybody. I
3 apologize for being late. My name is Shereen Lerner. I'm
4 one of the Commissioners on the IRC. Thank you for being --
5 thank you for being here.

6 MS. NEUMANN: Thank you, Commissioner Lerner.
7 And our Spanish interpreter.

8 SPANISH INTERPRETER: Hello, my name is Gabriel
9 Contreras, I'm the Spanish interpreter.

10 (Spanish language spoken.)

11 MS. NEUMANN: And we'll call our first five
12 speakers, if you could line up to my right.

13 Daniel Schwartz, Ulysses Correa, Gisell Garcia,
14 Martin Nowakowski, and Clair Van Steenwyk.

15 SPEAKER SCHWARTZ: I'm Dan Schwartz and I live in
16 Scottsdale precinct. I would like to thank the
17 Commissioners for the labors that have gotten us to version
18 1.0 draft maps.

19 As a matter of political geography, my natural
20 disposition is to look for how competitive a map is. From a
21 10,000-foot level, the legislative map does fairly well; I
22 know there are places where it could be tuned on
23 competitiveness and should provide something for each
24 stakeholder to be unhappy about. I would say that's a true
25 sign of success for a map.

1 From a more personal perspective, I'm a long-time
2 resident of the Scottsdale precinct who can be very
3 provincial, keeping my daily activities to the immediate
4 neighborhood as much as possible to shop, to eat, to work
5 and to walk.

6 What routinely takes me further afield is cycling,
7 which defines a dynamic community shaped by a common
8 interest of being outdoors and out of traffic. We, the
9 cyclists, inhabit the canal paths, the bike paths and the
10 less-trafficked streets. Many are passed chaotically,
11 circle Camelback Mountain, are deflected by the hills of PV
12 both and in some cases run up against the Phoenix Mountain
13 Preserves or even through it.

14 If you extend that dynamic community you would also
15 include the paths of those who hike and extend more deeply
16 into Camelback and Phoenix mountain. By the time you're
17 done, adding in the rest of the people who are neighbors,
18 you pretty much get a place I would call the Camelback
19 community of interest, you know, where many -- and this is
20 where many of us live out our daily lives, where we
21 recreate, shop, dine, worship and educate our children.

22 Yes, we do sometimes go beyond up north or out west
23 to vote, to visit larger islands of commerce or attend
24 cultural events, but this is where we live and would like to
25 be represented.

1 This concept of community is decently supported by
2 LD-4 as it's currently defined, so I would urge the
3 Commissioners to leave it largely intact. Some
4 modifications are clearly inevitable since it's 10,000 over
5 in population and has some split precincts. If I were to
6 tune its boundaries I would move the northern boundary
7 south, losing some population along the way.

8 May I continue?

9 MS. NEUMANN: That's time.

10 MS. CAMACHO: That's time.

11 SPEAKER SCHWARTZ: Okay. Okay. Thank you.

12 SPEAKER CORREA: Hello. Good evening,
13 Commissioner. My name is Ulysses Correa, I'm with Mi
14 Familia Vota and I'm from proposed District 25. I've been
15 living here in Avondale since I was born.

16 I have a family and relatives who live in LD-25 as
17 well and have suggested taking El Mirage entirely into LD-25
18 and add more of Avondale so that the city isn't split three
19 ways between 25, 22, 24.

20 These changes would keep similar communities
21 together, more accurately reflecting the changing nature of
22 the West Valley. Example: Urban communities, particularly
23 the growing Hispanic community of Goodyear, Litchfield Park,
24 and Avondale.

25 I would also like to mention I support the map

1 submitted by Latino Coalition for Fair Redistricting.

2 Thank you so much for your time and take care and
3 thank you for everything. Bye.

4 SPEAKER GARCIA: Hello. Good evening,
5 Commissioner.

6 My name is Gisell Garcia and I'm here representing
7 Mi Familia vota, which is a civic engagement organization,
8 nonprofit, that has been here in Arizona for over 15 years
9 in both Pinal and Maricopa County.

10 Our work is to ensure that the Latino community has
11 a voice in the political making process, and I just want to
12 state that Mi Familia Vota supports the map submitted by the
13 Latino Coalition for Fair Redistricting. We request more
14 competitive districts and Latino ability to elect districts
15 in both Southern Arizona and Maricopa County.

16 We just want to make sure that our community is
17 being heard and accounted for in these maps that will effect
18 us in the next ten years.

19 Thank you. Thank you, thank you so much for all
20 your work.

21 SPEAKER NOWAKOWSKI: Good evening. My name is
22 Martin Nowakowski, I'm from Glendale, Arizona. I'm here to
23 specifically ask the Commission to reconsider the eastern
24 boundary of Legislative District 25.

25 I asked you to have the area east of the Aqua Fria

1 River that is proposed to be in LD-25 to be redrawn into a
2 legislative district that lies east of the 101 freeway
3 corridor.

4 These -- this would be either LD-26 or LD-24.
5 The -- the community east of the Agua Fria, which by the way
6 serves as a natural boundary, has more commonalities and
7 community ties; and the representation we have now, we want
8 to continue that because we need strong advocacy for lower
9 income populations.

10 The proposed map will significantly diffuse and
11 break these -- these community commonalities and not allow
12 us to elect representation with a -- a higher degree of
13 advocacy and awareness of -- of our communities of interest
14 that share our values, that understands our educational
15 needs, our cultural needs and socioeconomic challenges.

16 I'm a dad and I have students who have gone to
17 Pendergast Elementary School District. This will take seven
18 schools and put them into a different district, breaking
19 them apart. I believe that education is one of the most
20 important issues and putting us into a community that has no
21 understanding of our educational needs, that is totally
22 different -- the communities of Pebble Creek, which is
23 55-plus, is different from our younger community; Luke Air
24 Force Base, which has 99 percent no children in their family
25 households; Loop 303 corridor is different from Loop 101.

1 Please keep -- thank you for your time.

2 SPEAKER STEENWYK: Good evening, my name is Clair
3 Van Steenwyk. I live presently in LD-22, soon to be LD-29,
4 and once again want to thank you for the changes you have
5 made up to this point to keep us basically together.

6 One more change we would like to see is that the
7 northwest of 303, which is -- is the -- is a precinct within
8 LD-22 and the Vistancia precinct which is I believe the name
9 is called -- let me look on here -- Vistancia Dusty Trail
10 Precinct and the new development, Desert Oasis Precinct off
11 Grand. You're breaking them up into different voting areas
12 when you do what you've done, and to factor the numbers in,
13 if you'd like, you could take those two precincts and put
14 them back into LD-29 and take El Mirage, which is growing
15 south toward Goodyear, and put it -- because it is bordered
16 on two sides which are natural borders, Aqua Fria being one
17 of them -- make it go south and that would augment the
18 population problem.

19 Other than that I want to thank you for what you've
20 done. I have this -- some other things to submit about CD-8
21 and its borders, but the one thing I like to submit to us in
22 all of these things is none of us are ever very happy with a
23 lot of the work that's done, but the reality is this: Like
24 it says on our money, E Pluribus Union (verbatim), from
25 many, one.

1 And I think it would be better off if we all
2 understood that and realize that no matter whether we're
3 male, female, black, white, brown, red, yellow or white,
4 we're supposed to learn how to work together, and to
5 resegment us into little districts just to please what we
6 could call either a -- our former nationality or whatever
7 you want to call it, doesn't make this the United States,
8 which is what you're supposed to really do.

9 Thank you for your time. God bless. Have a good
10 day.

11 MS. NEUMANN: Our next five speakers are Beatrice
12 Bouda, Alexis Delgado Garcia, Ivonne Dominguez, Annette
13 Alvarez Valencia, and Maribel Ponci.

14 SPEAKER BOUDA: Hello, my name is Beatrice Bouda.
15 I am 18 years old and I live on 43rd and Camelback in
16 Maryvale in the Alhambra district. I have lived here my
17 whole life and went and graduated from Metro Tech High
18 School and plan on going to community college in Glendale
19 Community College and I also work in Peoria.

20 COMMISSIONER LERNER: I'm sorry. It's me up here.
21 Could you lean -- it's hard to hear you, so if you
22 could speak a little more clearly that would be great
23 because I want to hear everything you have to say. Thank
24 you.

25 SPEAKER BOUDA: In our district, 52 percent of the

1 vote is Latino and 11 percent are Black. Like I said
2 before, I live and work in Peoria. I have seen the
3 difference in how people there work, talk and have
4 mannerisms. It is important that Peoria isn't included in
5 my congressional district because as much as I like my job,
6 Peoria is a majority conservative and they don't have the
7 same viewpoints as me. They don't have the same experience
8 as me, a Black woman living in Maryvale. This will affect
9 who is in office, how much funding is being invested where
10 and yet, again, we'll be left without representation.

11 Also Glendale needs to be included with my
12 district. That is my community of interest. That is where
13 most of my peers went to school. Glendale Community College
14 and the surrounding communities have been a part of the
15 experiences that I have been in.

16 It is vital they get to participate in voting
17 people in office with people that live like them, sounded
18 like them, understand their struggles and also have the same
19 values.

20 Thank you.

21 SPEAKER DELGADO GARCIA: Hello, can you hear me?

22 Cool. Are we good? Okay.

23 Hi, everyone. My name is Alexis Delgado Garcia.
24 I'm a community organizer for the organization Arizona
25 Center For Empowerment, also known as ACE. I'm 20 years

1 old, I'm actually an organizer with them. I also live in
2 District 30 and Congressional District 3. District 30 is
3 actually one of the poorest districts in all of Arizona, so
4 we consist of a lot of governmental assistance, like WIC,
5 AHCCCS, educational funding that I was a part of and I also
6 got to be thankfully a part of.

7 But as we're talking about congressional districts
8 and the different types of linings, I definitely agree with
9 Beatrice, we shouldn't include Peoria as they are majority
10 conservative and they don't vote and haven't lived the same
11 struggle as I have.

12 Also putting Peoria in our district means that
13 there's goes to be a raise of funding and people that are
14 actually needing things like AHCCCS and government
15 assistance like WIC are not going to be able to actually get
16 those needs because of the funding going up.

17 And another part of that is that I also go to
18 Glendale Community College and studying nonprofit
19 leadership -- nonprofit leadership and development alongside
20 American Sign Language and so I'm really, really happy to be
21 there and the people in Glendale Community College are also
22 a vital part of my community in Maryvale. They have talked
23 about the same struggles, the same experience; they've
24 talked about the same experience of going to El Walmart on
25 35th and Bethany Home. Going to El Super on 51st and

1 Camelback, right? They've also experienced going to
2 Alhambra High School where I went to and graduated from.
3 And so people in Glendale also have lived the same
4 experience that I have and they deserve to also vote with a
5 lot of the Latino and Black people in Maryvale.

6 Thank you.

7 SPEAKER DOMINGUEZ: Hello, can you hear me? Cool.

8 So my name is Ivonne Dominguez. I'm autistic and
9 I'm part of the LD-29 district and I'm a four-year student
10 that goes to Phoenix College, I'm actually about to get my
11 associates degree next year which I'm a bit excited.

12 And so -- yeah, so for me, like, as I see in my
13 community here, like the Arizona Latino Coalition for Fair
14 Redistricting presented a map for, like, Congressional
15 District 3, which was anonymously (verbatim) adopted until,
16 like, late in the mapping sessions so, like, you know, how,
17 like, this coalition proposed district was more compact than
18 the one on the draft map and it kept more communities of
19 interest together so, like, this draft of version -- of CD-3
20 brings a racially polo- -- excuse me -- polarizing voting
21 areas appear while taking out Latino areas of Glendale and
22 adds another city with very little in common with Peoria to
23 the district. So, like, please take Peoria out of CD-3 and
24 add back in the southeastern part of Glendale.

25 Also another thing, the southeastern part of

1 Glendale belongs in CD-3. It is a majority Latino area with
2 modest income families who shop together, who go to church
3 together and go to school together with the West Phoenix and
4 Maryvale area just across Camelback. They have much more in
5 common with West Phoenix. And also for mostly voters,
6 conservative and, like, you know, like them with Peoria
7 where only 20 percent of the population is Latino.

8 I'm asking the Commission to put Peoria back in
9 CD-8 and put the older more Latino part of Glendale in CD-3
10 but also most importantly who votes with people like me,
11 women of color, women with autism, students and Hispanic
12 women.

13 Thank you so much.

14 SPEAKER ALVAREZ: Hi, can you hear me? Thank you.

15 Okay. So hi, my name is Annette Alvarez. I'm
16 21 years old and I'm from District 30. So I've lived in
17 Maryvale for like 12 years. It is important that Glendale
18 is included in Maryvale votes since they have lived in the
19 same experience as people in Maryvale.

20 So I personally go to Glendale Community College
21 because people there know what it means to be Latino or
22 Hispanic. They deserve and should be able to vote with all
23 Maryvale folks who vote with Hispanic folks. Also making
24 sure that Peoria isn't in District 3 since they're mostly
25 conservative and haven't experienced livelihood in Maryvale

1 or with Hispanic folk.

2 SPEAKER PONCI: (Spanish language.)

3 Hello, my name is Maribel Ponci. I live in
4 District 3 at 57th and Bethany Home. I have lived there for
5 more than 20 years. It is important to include Glendale, it
6 is -- it is important to include Glendale with our vote in
7 district because they -- because our own neighbors are our
8 buddies, our friends and community, they have lived there
9 and they have the same experience as I do.

10 They should have the opinion, to be able to select
11 the representatives in Senate with the same ones as West
12 Phoenix in Avondale.

13 It's important that Peoria should not be included
14 because they don't have the same experience. Since the
15 majority of Peoria are conservators (verbatim) compare to
16 the ones in Glendale, who vote with Hispanics like me.

17 Please make and listen to the people in community.
18 Because it will affect us a lot.

19 Thank you so much and God bless you.

20

21 MS. NEUMANN: We'll now go back to Pinetop.

22 MS. CRANK: Our next speaker is Kodee Goseyun, Kim
23 Whitley, Jesse Chanley, Lisa Green, Sylvia Allen, Louise
24 Liggett, Jerry Hubbard, Jandi Craig, Mary Ann Joseph, Randy
25 Ruthier.

1 SPEAKER GOSEYUN: Hello, my name is Kodee Goseyun
2 from the San Carlos Apache tribe. I'm here on behalf of
3 Chairman Terry Rambler.

4 Chairman Neuberg, Vice Chairman Watchman and
5 Commissioners, on behalf of the 17,000 members of the
6 San Carlos Apache tribe, thank you for the opportunity to
7 host this important event and to provide comments on above
8 draft redistricting maps.

9 In response, please accept this letter as the
10 tribe's public comment as it pertains to the community of
11 interest that make up the currently proposed Legislative
12 District 6 and Congressional District 2 as set forth in
13 legislative test map version 10.0 and congressional test map
14 version 7.1 respectively.

15 Briefly, the tribe believes that any proposal to
16 revise district boundaries from the prior redistricting
17 cycle by fractionating the existing community of interest
18 shared among the seven tribes and their homelands will have
19 an adverse impact by diluting their current voting strength.
20 Moreover, dividing district boundaries should (verbatim)
21 splinter and dilute the community of interest shared among
22 tribes and tribal members who live off-reservation in nearby
23 cities and towns. Therefore, it is absolutely imperative
24 that the Commission maintain a robust Native American
25 majority-minority legislative district capable of electing

1 its preferred candidates into office.

2 The San Carlos Apache tribe's reservation is a
3 community of interest. The San Carlos Apache tribe is a
4 community of interest with the White Mountain Apache tribe
5 and the Navajo Nation and other rural tribes in northeastern
6 and northwestern Arizona. We continue to have concerns
7 about the inclusion of Flagstaff in the proposed Legislative
8 District 6 as discussed below.

9 Under the Voting Rights Act, our tribal members are
10 entitled to a district that gives us the opportunity to
11 elect candidates of our choice. If the Commission were to
12 include Flagstaff in Legislative District 6, it could
13 prevent us from electing candidates of choice into the
14 legislature.

15 Thank you.

16 SPEAKER WHITLEY: Hi, my name is Kimberly Whitley.
17 I've lived almost my entire life in Arizona; currently I
18 reside just down the road in Lakeside. I have a
19 nine-year-old son who will be old enough to vote before
20 these maps expire. My family understands that these maps
21 will have long-term consequences for ourselves and for all
22 Arizonans. We are alarmed by the number of uncompetitive
23 districts, both Democrat- and Republican-leaning in the
24 proposed draft maps. Competitive districts are essential to
25 rural areas that are often difficult and expensive to

1 canvass.

2 We need competitive maps to ensure that candidates
3 engage meaningfully with all their constituents. These maps
4 would create an environment where candidates are elected by
5 the dominant party's primary. This leave zero incentive for
6 candidates to engage with our local communities, respond to
7 our specific needs or amplify the voices of the significant
8 percentage of indigenous people in our region.

9 These maps eliminate the need to campaign and with
10 that, they eliminate a natural buffer against extremism.

11 I want to be represented by candidates who desire
12 my vote, who care about the people here, and who understand
13 that all communities in rural Arizona deserve consideration.
14 We believe that CD-2 in particular will fail to produce this
15 type of candidate. The lack of competition does a
16 disservice to everyone regardless of party or lifestyle.

17 We ask that the Commission redraw this district and
18 adopt the Navajo Nation Human Rights Commission map CDF010.

19 Thank you for your time, for this opportunity to
20 comment, and for your effort on this critical endeavor.

21 SPEAKER CHANLEY: Good evening, my name is Jesse
22 Chanley, I live in Navajo County just outside of Show Low
23 city limits.

24 I teach political science for Arizona State
25 University, and one of the biggest problems we have is voter

1 apathy and citizen apathy; and apathy is increased when we
2 have uncompetitive races, and so I would really encourage
3 you to create more competitive districts both at the
4 congressional and legislative level. And currently the
5 districts I would be in would be won every time by a single
6 party, it's not a situation that encourages participation.

7 So I would encourage you to consider the maps
8 offered by the Navajo Nation Human Rights Commission for the
9 Congressional Districts the CDF010 and the Legislative
10 Districts proposed by the Coconino County Board of
11 Commissioners Board of Supervisors LDF050 for District 7 and
12 LDF051 for District 6.

13 Thank you.

14 SPEAKER GREEN: Hello, my name is Lisa Green. I'm
15 a resident of Lakeside in the current Legislative
16 District 7. I am here to speak in honor of my great friend
17 David Peelman. David ran for the office of Arizona state
18 representative for LD-7 in the 2020 election. David
19 campaigned from one end of LD-7 to the other and understood
20 that because of how LD-7 is currently drawn, that he had
21 very little opportunity to be elected in LD-7. Despite
22 that, David did a great deal of outreach to the residents on
23 the reservation.

24 The current LD-7 is not a competitive district.
25 The current representatives in LD-7 do not come to speak to

1 us, we don't know them, we have never seen them and we have
2 never had the opportunity to hear from them.

3 I would like to thank the Commission for the
4 opportunity to speak here today. During the listening tour
5 in July we came and we spoke and told you that we wanted a
6 more competitive rural district, a return to the district we
7 had prior to the 2010 and 2011 redistricting, I feel that
8 you took our comments to heart and did listen to us. I
9 would like to say thank you for that.

10 I -- that being said, I do support the current
11 proposed maps for the new LD-6 and LD-7. I also support the
12 proposed map for CD-2.

13 As a resident of the current LD-7 I can tell you
14 that I don't feel like I have representation right now at
15 the Arizona state level. Because of that I appreciate the
16 opportunity to have the new LD-7 be drawn as a rural
17 community of interest while also making it a more
18 competitive legislative district.

19 Thank you.

20 SPEAKER ALLEN: Good evening. I very -- appreciate
21 the IRC being here and the White Mountain Apache hosting
22 this. I wanted to start off really quick that I support --
23 oh, I'm Sylvia Allen, former senator for District 5 and
24 District 6 and former Navajo County supervisor.

25 I support the CD-2 map that you have drawn because

1 it is maintaining a rural congressional district which I
2 think is important, and it's very difficult because in rural
3 Arizona we have less population and I would not want to see
4 you put any of Maricopa County into CD-2.

5 I want to say also that as Lisa said that you
6 listened to what we said in July when we talked about
7 communities of interest and how we wanted to have a rural
8 legislative district. I really support what you did with
9 your proposed District 8 map. You listened to the tribes
10 and how they wanted to maintain their Indian district. At
11 the same time, you listened to what we said here in
12 Show Low/Pinetop/Lakeside and in parts of south Navajo --
13 south Apache County and south Navajo County that we wanted
14 to be reunited as communities of interest because we are and
15 we made a -- a huge argument to that point.

16 As well as we lobbied for a -- a rural legislative
17 district that included parts of the old District 5 District
18 counties.

19 Now, the argument about Flagstaff doesn't fit is
20 just totally wrong. For one thing, Flagstaff is 63 percent
21 Democrat. This is going to maintain a Democrat district.
22 This is -- District 6 is a Democrat district and they're
23 going to be able to elect people as they have throughout the
24 last ten years. And the reason they want to put Flagstaff
25 into District 7 is because they want to dilute the

1 Republican vote. And you can't have it both ways.

2 And District 7, the way you've drawn District 7, I
3 want to thank you again for what you did. Just please work
4 to make it more rural. The urban part that you have put in
5 District 7, we need to have that removed and add in more of
6 rural Arizona so that we can maintain our rural communities.

7 Thank you very much. Thank you.

8 SPEAKER LIGGETT: Good evening, honorable
9 Commissioners. Being robbed of our voice in the state
10 legislature by the previous IRC Commissioners, rural
11 Arizonans have been forced to endure taxation without
12 representation.

13 Truly your IRC would be dishonest and highly
14 irresponsible to bury our rural voice again within a largely
15 urban district.

16 Rural Arizona is not a dying way of life but a
17 living hope for Arizona's future. We are strong-principled
18 citizens. We are a valuable reminder of the struggles of
19 the past, a teacher of the ways of life, and that includes
20 the Native Americans.

21 We are a witness to the flaws of our forefathers
22 and their amazing successes through ingenuity and
23 perseverance. We are necessary. Urban residents dream
24 about leaving the city behind to visit rural Arizona.
25 Tourism floods our Arizona highways, they travel to our

1 small towns and wilderness areas to use our roads, our
2 forests, lakes, mountains, the amenities we build and
3 caretake so they can unwind and reconnect with nature.

4 Our rural atmosphere is beautifully healing and
5 restoring to mind, body and spirit. We are necessary. We
6 must be protected.

7 That is why you must restore our rural voice by
8 sanctifying a truly rural district. You must make it
9 happen.

10 We support the IRC draft map LD-7 with changes that
11 will establish a rural voice.

12 We must -- we also support the IRC draft map of LDS
13 Native American district combined with Flagstaff which are
14 communities of interest rather than with our rural district.

15 Thank you very much.

16 SPEAKER HUBBARD: Good evening, members of the
17 Commission. My name is Jerry Hubbard and my wife and I live
18 in eastern Arizona in the town of Overgaard in southern
19 Navajo County. This beautiful part of our state includes
20 large areas of national forest lands and the White
21 Mountains.

22 Our citizens live in rural areas and small towns,
23 and we have common interests economically and culturally
24 including farming, ranching, mining, forestry and tourism.
25 Visitors from the Phoenix valley and elsewhere come here to

1 enjoy hunting, fishing, camping, hiking, and stargazing.

2 Because we have limited private lands, we are very
3 concerned with the issues of water, electric power,
4 education, and federal land management.

5 These issues are unique to our area and quite
6 different from Metro Phoenix or Tucson or the suburban
7 communities surrounding them. Our common interests unite
8 our citizens instead of being divided by political or racial
9 differences.

10 Ten years ago our district was divided up into four
11 other districts, all of which included urban or metropolitan
12 areas which very much diluted our voices and our voting
13 power in the legislature.

14 We are asking the Commission to reunite the
15 five-plus eastern counties according to the legislative map
16 currently proposed for Legislative District 7, with some
17 minor changes.

18 The district would include all of Graham, Greenlee
19 and Gila Counties, the southern portion of Navajo and Apache
20 counties along with eastern Pinal, northern Cochise and
21 southeast Yavapai Counties.

22 This would result in a district that is solely
23 rural and undivided. In addition we would recommend the
24 proposed map for Legislative District 6 to include Flagstaff
25 in the Native American district.

1 Thank you for this opportunity to comment.

2 SPEAKER CRAIG: Excuse me.

3 (Apache language spoken.)

4 My name is Jandi Craig. I'm a member of the White
5 Mountain Apache tribe and I appreciate living in Pinetop
6 where my work, my homestead, and my family are on the Fort
7 Apache Reservation.

8 The White Mountain Apache tribe is a community of
9 interest with the cities of Pinetop-Lakeside and Show Low.
10 Tribal members like myself living in nearby towns such as
11 Pinetop and Show Low should not be excluded from the
12 proposed LD-6. My children, along with the many other
13 tribal children, attend school at Blue Ridge and Show Low
14 schools. Buses transport our children to and from the
15 reservation to these schools daily. We would like for these
16 school districts to remain in the same legislative district.
17 We propose that the Native American majority-minority
18 district be as close as possible to the district that was
19 created in the last redistricting cycle.

20 CD-2 is 22 percent Native American. Voter
21 registration increased this past election, including a
22 12 percent increase of Democratic voters in Native American
23 communities. Under the Voting Rights Act, our tribal
24 members are entitled to a district that give us the
25 opportunity to elect candidates of our choice.

1 Including Pinetop, Show Low, Springerville in CD-2
2 would allow us to elect candidates of choice. In 2004
3 Native American voters were unable to elect their candidate
4 of choice in the only Native American majority-minority
5 district in the state because Flagstaff voters mobilized to
6 defeat the Native American candidate of choice.

7 When the district was redrawn after 2010, the
8 Native American majority-minority district excluded
9 Flagstaff. Flagstaff has grown by over 18 percent since the
10 last census, a much higher rate than any of the
11 off-reservation border towns in northern Arizona. This
12 means that Native Americans will likely lose the majority
13 during the decade and further be impacted from electing
14 candidates of choice if they are kept with the whole city of
15 Flagstaff.

16 Native Americans are the most underpopulated race
17 in the census. Arizona's ranked number one in the U.S. with
18 the highest number of American Indians and Alaska Natives
19 living in hard-to-count census tracts, with 68.1 percent of
20 the state's Native population living in hard-to-count areas.
21 Poverty, lack of broadband services, housing insecurity,
22 language barriers and the pandemic further increases the
23 risk that the 2020 census undercounted Arizona's
24 Native American population.

25 The Voting Rights Act instructs the IRC to use its

1 lawful discretion to protect the interests of the only
2 Native American majority-minority legislative district in
3 Arizona. The Commission should deviate greater from the
4 target population due to this undercount in order to create
5 a strong Native American majority-minority district.

6 The U.S. Supreme Court has affirmed that total
7 population deviations of 10 percent or less are
8 presumptively constitutional, and population deviations
9 greater than 10 percent may be justified by a legitimate
10 state interest such as preserving a strong Native American
11 majority-minority district. The Commission should
12 underpopulate the Native American district more in order to
13 maintain a strong Native American majority-minority district
14 under VRA as a strong interest.

15 We do not support the draft map and we request the
16 map to remain as close to current maps as possible.

17 Thank you.

18 (Apache language spoken.)

19 SPEAKER JOSEPH: Good evening and thank you for
20 allowing me this opportunity to speak with you.

21 My name is Mary Ann Joseph and I've been a taxpayer
22 and a citizen of Arizona for more than -- more years than
23 I'd like to talk about. At least over 50 years as a
24 taxpayer and involved in the communities I live in Arizona
25 because I am native.

1 And I applaud everyone for all their passion and
2 their concern. I really love the fact that we're going to
3 try to figure out how to all get along because our futures
4 are what is at stake here, and I haven't really heard other
5 than the one gentleman out of Avondale speak about dollars.

6 So I would urge you to keep that in mind because as
7 we all get squeezed for more and more dollars to support
8 what's happening in our nation and in our great state of
9 Arizona, we have to keep that in mind as well. So I am in
10 support I believe to the proposed with minor changes.

11 I appreciate all the hard work and I wish you all
12 very good luck on how you're going to make this all work for
13 all of us.

14 Thank you.

15 SPEAKER RUTHIER: Good evening, Commissioners. My
16 name is Randy Ruthier, I'm from Taylor. I appreciate the
17 time to address you today.

18 I'm here to express my support of Arizona approved
19 draft maps LD-6, LD-7, and Congressional District 2.

20 I approve Flagstaff remaining in LD-6. AZ approved
21 draft map LD-7 preserves a conservative way of life. I
22 don't support Maricopa County moving into Congressional
23 District 2.

24 And I'll cut -- cut off there and thank you for
25 your time and wish you a happy Christmas.

1

2

MS. CRANK: Madam Chair, members of the Commission and listening audience, I have three more speakers and then we will take a break after that time.

3

4

Marian Quintero, Holly Hanson, Dave Berry.

5

6

After the break we will send it back over to Avondale.

7

8

Marian Quintero.

9

10

SPEAKER QUINTERO: Good evening, my name is Marian Quintero. I am a member of the White Mountain Apache tribe. I'm here in -- to represent my community.

11

12

As a member of the White Mountain Apache, it is important for my nation to have a good relationship with our congressional person and all elected leaders at the state and federal level.

13

14

15

16

The government-to-government relationship is critical for protecting tribal -- tribal sovereignty and allows us as White Mountain Apache people to successfully manage our nation because what is ultimately decided by policy for funding elections and much more directly impacts our daily life. I don't -- the current -- the current draft map of CD-2 is diluting our Native American vote and it's disheartening and it concerns me as a tribal member.

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

I'm concerned that the congressional draft map CD-2 has changed my district from being highly competitive to

1 being a Republican district. I know that every vote in my
2 current district counts and I have seen my congressional
3 representative work hard to make sure that all the issues of
4 my community and many other communities address (verbatim).

5 Our current representative worked hard for everyone
6 on and off the tribal lands. If the Republicans are given a
7 chance to consistently win elections without having to work
8 for -- for every constituent and genuinely include
9 communities like mine, I know that our voting power will be
10 diminished and that I will not have the same quality of
11 representation I have right now, adding -- adding more
12 Republicans to my district by redrawing the map to -- thank
13 you.

14 SPEAKER HANSON: Hello to the Commissioners and
15 thank you for this opportunity to speak.

16 I've lived -- I've lived in Pinetop-Lakeside since
17 1975 and I appreciate the -- the beauty of this -- this area
18 and so I'm here to speak for the -- the trees, the water,
19 the wildlife. And I think they are the reason that I moved
20 here and I hope that they continue to be as vibrant and
21 healthy as they are now, but I -- I see that it's kind of --
22 they're kind of at risk.

23 And that's really all I have to say. I haven't
24 heard anyone speak for them; they don't have a voice really.

25 Thank you for what you're doing.

1 SPEAKER BERRY: My name is Dave Berry. I'm
2 Apache County. Thank you, Commissioners, for what you have
3 been doing so hopefully the --

4 Thanks for setting this up so that people could
5 express themselves here.

6 And tribal members, thank you.

7 I want to make an appeal here to ensure my voice
8 for retired people in the matter of voting equality. I'm
9 confident that trappers, farmers, cattlemen, loggers, small
10 businessmen, government employees, the political class and
11 Realtors have a voice in redistricting. Let's make sure
12 that tourist industry and the indigenous people and retired
13 are heard from, too.

14 For example, please do what you can to avoid
15 overloading these districts with the people known to be
16 champions of the extractive industries.

17 Thank you.

18 MS. CRANK: At this time we will take a five-minute
19 break. It is 7:31, we will be back at 7:36 p.m.

20 Five-minute break for our transcriptionist.

21 (Recess taken from 7:32 p.m. to 7:37 p.m.)

22

23 MS. NEUMANN: Lynn Peters, Trey Terry, Athena
24 Stuart, Lan Hoang, Jeffrey Specter, and -- let's see. That
25 was five.

1 Go ahead.

2 SPEAKER PETERS: Good evening, Commissioners. My
3 name is Lynn Peters and I have lived in the city of Surprise
4 for 21 years. Today I am here to testify about the lack of
5 competitive districts in the current draft maps.

6 The criterion for competitive district --
7 competitiveness has been described as secondary based on the
8 freezing of the Arizona Constitution that it should be
9 considered, quote, "where to do so would create no
10 significant detriment to other goals," end quote. But the
11 other goals have similar limitations described as, quote,
12 "where practicable." Mapping consultant Doug Johnson has
13 explained competitiveness is viewed by the courts as having
14 equal rights to the others.

15 Uncompetitive districts can ensure -- encourage
16 candidates to appeal to the most extreme elements of the
17 electorate. There are 13 proposed safe Democratic
18 legislative districts; there are 15 proposed safe Republican
19 legislative districts; there are only two very competitive
20 districts within a 4-point vote spread: LD-2 and LD-4.
21 Four of the safe districts are within a 7-point vote spread
22 and sometimes considered competitive. Despite this, LD-9
23 and LD-23 favor Democrats, LD-13 favors Republicans, LD-16
24 is safely Republican in all nine measured elections.

25 The districting -- the district mapping would

1 likely ensure that Democrats never have an outright majority
2 in our state legislature.

3 The criterion of equal population across districts
4 is important but it can vary up to 10 percent between the
5 most and least populace legislative districts. This can
6 permit the Commission to take smaller communities of
7 interest into consideration and make them more competitive.
8 This has been proven in the U.S. Supreme Court.

9 MS. NEUMANN: That's time, ma'am. Thank you.

10 SPEAKER PETERS: I'm done.

11 MS. NEUMANN: Trey Terry.

12 SPEAKER TERRY: Good evening. My name is Trey
13 Terry, I'm a governing board member on the Agua Fria Union
14 High School District and I just want to speak a little bit
15 about my communities of Avondale, Goodyear, Buckeye,
16 Litchfield Park. We are a Southwest Valley, Maricopa
17 County, Phoenix-based community 20 minutes from downtown.

18 I know there -- in the past, ten years ago, my
19 school district has five high schools. We were split into
20 four different legislative districts, you know, going all
21 the way to Yuma and, you know, so many different things.

22 I wanted to speak on, you know, making sure that we
23 create Maricopa County-based districts out here.

24 Two issues that aren't really partisan: Water and
25 transportation. Not only are our water issues different

1 than Yuma's, they conflict. Our area is one of the fastest
2 growing communities in the entire country; city of Buckeye
3 is the fastest, Goodyear shortly behind on it.

4 So on that front, just wanted to make sure that you
5 know our -- our issues whether -- you know, nonpartisan
6 issues are completely different than the rural communities
7 and at the same time I would argue we're completely
8 different than the communities once you go inside the 101;
9 or as was mentioned previously, the Agua Fria River is a
10 natural boundary that separates a lot of these older
11 communities that have been here for 40-plus years as opposed
12 to the new ones that are coming out.

13 Speaking briefly on your proposed LD-25, there's a
14 portion that goes like into Peoria, into Glendale -- well,
15 like, past 83rd Avenue. That's completely different than
16 some of our communities out near Luke Air Force Base,
17 Verrado and the school district that I represent.

18 And then also wanted to draw your attention to
19 north of the mountain you kind of split Wittmann and
20 Sun City Festival from that and they can only be reached by
21 going completely around the mountain and through other
22 districts.

23 So with that, have a good evening.

24 SPEAKER STUART: Good evening, Commissioner.

25 My name is Athena Stuart. I'm an organizer with

1 Stanford Children, a nonprofit education advocacy education.
2 The focus is on ensuring that Arizona provides equitable
3 education across the state. I'm also a resident of
4 Goodyear.

5 Avondale is a key city here in the West Valley and
6 we work well with our neighboring cities. Today I'd like to
7 talk about Goodyear where I've lived for the past two
8 decades and have built my family of two littles who have
9 grown to love the diversity the city brings.

10 I'd like our cities Avondale and Goodyear to be
11 together in one congressional district. Our cities are
12 similar. We are close in size and have both grown a lot in
13 recent years. We're both family-friendly cities and our
14 residents are very connected, working and shopping and going
15 to school across city boundaries. The West Valley deserves
16 to have more than one voice representing us in Congress to
17 make sure we get our fair share of federal funding and
18 aren't passed over for Phoenix.

19 We're excited that our West Valley cities may get
20 more funding with the new infrastructure bill, maybe with
21 Build Back Better also since significant federal investment
22 is key to keeping up with the growth in our area.

23 I'm a resident of Goodyear and would like to see
24 Avondale and Goodyear in the same congressional district
25 where we can make our voices heard and get fair

1 representation and someone who would work for our unique
2 West Valley needs.

3 Additionally, redistricting Peoria with the West
4 Valley is controversial for many reasons. I'm a product of
5 public education who lived in Glendale but attended high
6 school in Peoria and I can tell you that I never felt fairly
7 represented as a Latinx in a primarily conservative city
8 like Peoria. People didn't look like me, they didn't talk
9 like me and certainly didn't live like me.

10 Currently West Valley is a Hispanic majority
11 district and replacing Glendale for Peoria would not fairly
12 represent our Latino community. Voting Rights Act -- Voting
13 Rights Act requirements must be kept at the forefront of
14 every conversation and any map considered must first meet
15 these requirements.

16 Latinos are far more than a community of interest.
17 Latino voters are a populace minority constituency protected
18 by federal law and its mandate to maintain and expand the
19 voting strength of Arizona. Latinos must be kept in mind
20 when the Commission reviews and makes changes to these draft
21 maps.

22 Thanks for your time.

23 SPEAKER HOANG: Good evening, Commissioners. Thank
24 you for your time and effort in doing such an important job
25 to make sure our districts are being drawn fairly and

1 competitively.

2 My name is Lan Hoang. I'm a mother of three, I
3 grew up in Central Phoenix, I went to elementary school
4 here, high school and universities for my bachelor and
5 master degree.

6 Over the past 20 years I've noticed the lack of
7 funding and representation in my Congressional District 1.
8 There should be a Central Phoenix district that gives the
9 city and its resident proper representation in Congress.

10 As one of the largest growing metropolitan areas in
11 the country, Phoenix should be an anchor to a congressional
12 district so it can receive the services and representation
13 it needs to secure federal grants and funding for critical
14 transportation and infrastructure projects needed for a city
15 of this size.

16 If anyone has taken the public city bus, you would
17 know what I'm talking about.

18 The district should include Downtown Phoenix,
19 Encanto, the historic neighborhoods north of Downtown and
20 the northern Phoenix neighborhoods up to the 101. This
21 would keep these Phoenix communities together and give them
22 the ability to influence an election and have a
23 representative that serves this growing area.

24 This configuration would support and keep whole
25 small business communities, historic neighborhoods, and

1 LGBTQ communities that have all asked to be kept together.

2 This would also mean that neighborhood north of the
3 101 which did not want to be connected to Central Phoenix
4 are able to be connected in a different district per their
5 wishes.

6 Again, thank you for your time and I wish you luck
7 in making your decisions.

8 Good night.

9 SPEAKER SPECTER: Good evening, members of the
10 Redistricting Commission. My name is Jeff Specter. I am a
11 resident of Goodyear, Arizona, in Maricopa County. And I
12 live within the proposed draft maps for Congressional
13 District 9 and Legislative District 25.

14 I support these maps because for the most part they
15 include -- they interlay the communities of interest in my
16 area of Goodyear, Litchfield Park, and portions of Buckeye.
17 People in these communities have common -- common interests,
18 whether it be land development matters, public safety,
19 education, water, transportation, as well as issues
20 pertaining to Luke Air Force Base. We share shopping,
21 medical services, churches, school districts and social
22 activities.

23 So I just appreciate you listening to what I had to
24 say tonight and thank you.

25

1 MS. NEUMANN: Thank you.

2 Our next five speakers are Summer Baker, Richard
3 Hopkins, Wes Crew, Lisa Sung, and Dewana Schultz.

4 SPEAKER BAKER: Hello, my name is Summer Baker.
5 And I want to stress the importance -- sorry.

6 And I want to stress the importance of compact
7 geographic areas, areas of interest and respect to city and
8 town boundaries. I live off of Baseline Road and Mill
9 Avenue and my community is made up of hardworking
10 single-family homes. We go to school, work and spend our
11 leisure time in areas of Ahwatukee, south Tempe and west
12 Chandler. We share similar priorities, interests and values
13 amongst ourselves.

14 There's been talk in this meeting and previous
15 hearings for the Commission to stick to a single
16 requirement, competitiveness. When residents claim they
17 want competitiveness, what they really are saying is they
18 want everything to be 50/50. The sad truth is, this
19 disenfranchises half of the community. If the Commission
20 were to focus their time on other requirements such as
21 keeping districts geographically compact, respecting city
22 and county boundaries and community of interest, then these
23 districts would fairly represent the majority of people that
24 live in them. This is why people move or remain in certain
25 areas.

1 Previously my community was grouped into an LD that
2 hardly had any association with the interests and values of
3 the other parts of town I described earlier. It made no
4 sense to have south of Southern Road from Priest to
5 McKlintock grouped into the entire Salt River Indian
6 Reservation. That part of their town does their shopping,
7 work and their kids go to school in areas of Mesa. It would
8 make more sense to group them into an LD in Mesa where they
9 have a majority when picking their candidates and
10 representatives. It's not fair to the people on the
11 reservation or in my community where we live to only be
12 represented part of the time.

13 This is why the Commission needs to focus on
14 drawing districts that first and foremost have equal
15 population which our LD-8 draft map 10 does not adhere to;
16 second, respect the communities of like interest; and
17 lastly, keeping districts compact with respecting city and
18 town boundaries.

19 Please move LD-8's south boundary to south of
20 (technical/audio disruption) Road -- thank you.

21 SPEAKER HOPKINS: Madam Chair, members of the
22 Commission, my name is Richard Hopkins and I'm the senior
23 member of the Buckeye Elementary School District governing
24 board. Our elementary school district has been a singular
25 community of interest for each of the 131 years that we have

1 been organized. Every child, parent and other resident of
2 the district has the same interest: A great public
3 education, safety, and well spending of their tax dollars.

4 The previous legislative districts, we were split
5 into two, with four for the most part living in Yuma, a two
6 and a half hour drive away so you know how long we saw them.

7 This current map splits us into three with
8 possibility of representation in Tucson, Laveen, Tolleson or
9 up in the Sun City areas.

10 I appreciate the draft map that you drew, LD0011.
11 That would keep our school district in one legislative
12 district as it would our neighboring districts Liberty,
13 Arlington, Palo Verde, Buckeye Union High School,
14 Wickenburg, Gila Bend and Paloma and the other one down
15 there that escapes me.

16 So, respectfully request that we keep our school
17 district together; and speaking of our friends in Gila Bend,
18 the draft maps have their 480 school -- excuse me --
19 480-student district split into three separate legislative
20 districts and their 2,100-member town also split into three
21 separate districts.

22 I know you will do what's right and I appreciate
23 the hard work that you have all put in.

24 Thank you.

25 SPEAKER SUNG: Good evening, Commissioners and to

1 the public. My name is Lisa Sung. I reside in West Phoenix
2 near Tolleson in Avondale. My family and I have been there
3 since 2005 and currently it's LD-19 and into LD-22 with the
4 current draft map.

5 As you can see from the map, our square miles has
6 increased almost 20 times, meaning that our population will
7 be concentrated over 50 percent in less than one-twentieth
8 of that new area; therefore, when we have elected officials
9 running for public office, we will not be represented, with
10 more of a diluted population concentration that has expanded
11 almost 20 times.

12 In addition the current draft map of LD-22 has
13 potentially four-to-five congressional district overlap,
14 therefore diluting representation and funding for us from
15 the federal and the state level.

16 Lastly, with the deviation numbers with the
17 population of every 30 district on the draft map is
18 unconstitutional. According to our framers of the
19 Constitution, we are to be represented by population. The
20 deviation varies greatly and it -- disadvantage people of
21 color, meaning the deviation is over 10 percent, again
22 resulting in less representation and less funding.

23 Moving forward, please consider these variations
24 because it will lead to opposition, challenges and of course
25 it will be -- have to be resolved in the court -- the court

1 law, therefore costing all Arizonans taxpayers' money.

2 Thank you for your time.

3 SPEAKER SCHULTZ: Goods evening, committee members,
4 My name is Chris Schultz. I'm precinct committeeman for the
5 Libertarian party for the Cortez precinct.

6 Looking at the proposed map for Congressional
7 District 3 and the LD-19, both of them are improved in my
8 opinion from the prior map as at least for CD-3 we're no
9 longer part of Tucson.

10 Looking at the statistics, however, there's still a
11 vote spread of 40 percent in CD-3 and 17 percent in LD-19,
12 which as a third party who tends to ride down the middle
13 means that none of our candidates will ever stand a chance
14 in these districts.

15 Alternatively, for anyone that happens to be more
16 conservative, the vote spread also means that those
17 individuals will not receive representation at any rate
18 because the vote spread in a state as close as ours is
19 exceeding what it should be to be a competitive district.

20 So as much as these districts have been improved,
21 they need to be improved further to make sure that the vote
22 spread is in the competitive rate and in line with what it
23 should be, as we should not be focusing on where we are
24 different, we should be focusing on where we are the same in
25 the Arizona and for what our areas' differences and

1 similarities are. A candidate should have to appeal to both
2 sets of bases to win an election, and at this point in the
3 districts for which I reside I will not have my particular
4 political leanings represented at any rate.

5 I thank the Commission for the work that they've
6 done so far and look forward to any future revisions
7 thereof.

8 UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: Good evening, Commissioners,
9 Commissioner Lerner.

10 Firstly, I would like to thank the Commission for
11 the work that they're doing and for also for the geographic
12 location that you're in. I think it's really important that
13 you brought the tribal community to the table and to the
14 forefront of this process. Not only does it mean a lot to
15 the people that we advocate for, it means a lot to the
16 community that you're here and so thank you for that and
17 thank you for the work you're doing.

18 But the -- the regards that I have tonight are
19 based off of CD-3, CD-8 that are in Phoenix as pertains to
20 some of my colleagues that joined me earlier tonight and
21 some of the statements that were made.

22 We, the communities that we vote in, the
23 communities that we live in, in Avondale, Maryvale and
24 Glendale, believe that we should all be voting together and
25 that the provisions that have been made to add Peoria to

1 District 3 is obscene.

2 Peoria doesn't identify with a lot of the
3 communities that vote together, including the other half of
4 Avondale that's included in District 3, so we're suggesting
5 that you take Peoria out, put that into District 8, include
6 Glendale in District 3 and keep Avondale and Goodyear
7 together in a voting district, as those two communities of
8 interest are very alike in economic status and in -- in
9 voting preferences.

10 And secondly, I'd like to make a note of the
11 concern of the district in district which I believe is
12 LD-17, which is currently attached to what is now LD-10 in
13 Tucson which separates the voting -- that separates the
14 voting spread that is in the eastern side of Tanque Verde.
15 Tanque Verde needs to be able to vote with the districts
16 that neighbors it to the west of LD-10 of which the like
17 community of interest. So that is all that I have.

18 Like I said, thank you so much for letting us be a
19 part of the process including Pinetop, and I really look
20 forward to the rest of the hearings.

21 Thank you.

22 MS. NEUMANN: Thank you.

23 Our last five speakers are Natacha Chavez, Sandra
24 Dowling, Jordi Santos, Monica Ortez and Max White.

25 SPEAKER CHAVEZ: Hi, thank you very much. I will

1 make this quick as I have two minutes.

2 I wanted to support the Arizona Latino Coalition
3 for Fair Redistricting map. Also on a personal note I lived
4 in the Westridge (phonetic) precinct which is in the
5 proposed 22, and as you -- as you guys have it proposed,
6 I -- we are now lumped in with most of the West Valley, I
7 would like to find a way to keep West Phoenix with West
8 Phoenix. Also, I would like to ask to not split Avondale
9 whichever precinct you put it in -- I mean district you put
10 it in, it doesn't matter as long as you keep Avondale
11 together.

12 So thank you for your time.

13 SPEAKER DOWLING: Good evening, my name is Sandra
14 Dowling. I'm the legislative district chairman for the
15 current Legislative District 13 for the Arizona Republican
16 party. I will -- depending on what the boundary lines look
17 like, I will be in one of two possible districts in the West
18 Valley but looking at the majority of my district right now,
19 I'd like to commend the Commission for the work they've done
20 because I think they did a great job and I think that it's
21 truly represented and reflective of our community itself.

22 However the questions that I have related to this
23 are very technical in detail. I have gone through every
24 single precinct that will be in the new District 25, as well
25 as the ones that are currently in there, and I've looked at

1 them to make sure that one minor issue didn't get
2 overlooked, and that is where precincts are being split
3 between one district or another. And I've made a list of
4 the precincts that are in either District 29 or in
5 District 22 or -- or whatever district, I didn't -- I didn't
6 note it on my -- on my paper here but I can -- I can follow
7 up with that if you'd like.

8 Cordony district is split, Vermont precinct is
9 split -- I mean -- I'm sorry, Cordone precinct. Vermont
10 precinct is split, Purple Sage precinct is split, Osuna --
11 Osuna Park precinct is split, Sun Air precinct is split,
12 Youngtown is split, Dysart is split, and Rancho Mirage is
13 split.

14 So each of those districts would create a logistic
15 problem for both Republicans and Democrats as we try to
16 handle our district itself because half of our precinct
17 would be in one district and half would be in another. Some
18 of those areas it looks like today they might be vacant
19 land, but I know that that's not going to prevail in the
20 next two to three years and obviously for the next ten
21 years. So if there's -- if there's a way to handle this,
22 either going through the Board of Supervisors and asking
23 them to redo the precincts or if there's a way for the
24 Commission to handle it -- I'm very well aware that if you
25 move one line, then another line has to move. And -- and I

1 don't necessarily want that to -- to mess things up either,
2 but those are the technical questions I have.

3 So thank you very much.

4 COMMISSIONER LERNER: I'm sorry. (Technical
5 disruption.) I say just please -- these kind of technical
6 things, please submit. It's the same thing as what we've
7 heard from others.

8 SPEAKER DOWLING: Okay.

9 COMMISSIONER LERNER: For everybody who is
10 submitting some things like that, we would love to have you
11 submit your comments. We have lots of opportunities if you
12 go to our website, you can put those in there.

13 SPEAKER DOWLING: Okay. All right. Thank you very
14 much.

15 SPEAKER SANTOS: Hello. So my name is Jordi. My
16 father has worked in Maryvale for years, for my mother who
17 has sold food to our neighbors and my friends for years, and
18 for my friends who have to have gone to middle school, high
19 school and college with me; 43rd and Thomas is where I have
20 oriented my life all since I was young and growing up.
21 Where many of my friends and I have laughed, played, and
22 explored the neighbors that we lived in and the people who
23 are a part of my life, these are my friends and who have
24 changed my life.

25 A sudden change of redistricting will change part

1 of my home, a sudden change where Peoria is added and
2 Glendale is taken away. Peoria isn't a part of my home,
3 Glendale isn't a part of -- Glendale is a part of my home.

4 Getting the representation we deserve and that we
5 know that we need and that we have fought for, like the
6 roads that -- that stop us from getting us to work and the
7 roads that have stopped us from getting to school. We have
8 worked here, we have went to school here, and we have went
9 to church here. We deserve to say that we have lived here
10 in our communities and we deserve to say that Peoria isn't
11 our home and that Glendale is.

12 To keep our home as it has and to keep the people
13 that have worked in these homes, we want our district to
14 stay the same.

15 Thank you.

16 SPEAKER ORTIZ: Hi, everyone. My name is Monica,
17 Monica Ortiz. I have lived or I live in District 3. I went
18 to school there, high school, elementary school and now I am
19 currently going to university in the middle of -- right on
20 the border in Glendale and Peoria, and it's quite a
21 different feeling that -- sorry. It's quite a different
22 feeling than what I'm used to.

23 I know when I'm going over to Peoria, right, like,
24 as soon as I go down the street. So I think that keeping
25 Peoria separate from Glendale and not taking out Glendale is

1 a priority and just to make sure that we're keeping the
2 communities together, since we've already been living that
3 way for so long.

4 Okay. Let's see.

5 This coalition proposed districts more compact than
6 one on the draft map that kept more communities of interest
7 together. This draft version of CD-3 brings interracially
8 polarized voting areas in Peoria while taking out Latino
9 areas of Glendale and adds other cities very little in
10 common such as Peoria to the district. Please take Peoria
11 out of CD-3 and add it back the southeastern part of
12 Glendale.

13 Thank you.

14 SPEAKER WHITE: Good evening, Commissioner, Chair
15 Neuberg, Vice Chair Watchman, Commissioner Lerner. Thank
16 you for being here in Avondale, Commissioner Mehl and
17 Commissioner York.

18 My name is Max White. I live in the city of
19 Avondale and I've been honored to be appointed to
20 Neighborhood and Family Services as well as the Board of
21 Adjustments, and I'm very grateful Ken Weise and Avondale
22 city council has opened up these chambers for you to be
23 here.

24 As many others have said, the city of Avondale is a
25 very beautiful place with the Tres Rios area, many

1 recreational areas, we're very close to Goodyear, and your
2 maps -- we would love to submit a draft map.

3 But I want to invite you to do something
4 revolutionary: Keep cities together in Arizona. There's no
5 reason to split up cities, whether it's Avondale, whether
6 it's Glendale. Keep cities in the same legislative and
7 congressional districts. That makes sense. Do things that
8 make sense for our kids. In Avondale we have Litchfield
9 Elementary School District, Pendergast-Avondale Elementary
10 School District, Littleton Elementary School District,
11 Tolleson Union High School, and Aqua Fria Union High School.

12 We need to keep our kids' interests at the
13 forefront. We're thinking ten years from now, these ten
14 years from now these kids will be voting, some of them, so
15 we want to make sure we put our children's interests ahead
16 of our own.

17 In addition to that, we want to make sure to the
18 extent practicable that we keep the districts even for
19 legislative districts. Thinking of that 238,383, -82 people
20 in each legislative district, make sure those are compact.

21 I would love to continue to recommend draft maps
22 but you have mapping advisors, you have voting rights
23 experts, you have attorneys, please take their advisement.
24 We need to do something revolutionary. Our communities of
25 interest are already here, we're called cities.

1 Thank you so much.

2 MS. NEUMANN: That concludes our speakers here in
3 Avondale. We'll go back to Vice Chair Watchman in Pinetop.

4 VICE CHAIR WATCHMAN: Thank you, Avondale, for
5 wonderful comments; and to those that are here, we
6 appreciate your comments and thank you for joining us this
7 evening.

8 Please go online and submit, if you choose to do
9 so, your map using our software and you can find that at
10 IRC.AZ.gov.

11 We will be in Payson tomorrow and Window Rock to
12 continue these public hearings on the draft maps.

13 So with that we want to say thank you for joining
14 us. Please be safe on your travels home.

15 So the meeting is adjourned and good night
16 everybody. Thank you.

17 (Whereupon the meeting concludes at 8:08 p.m.).

18

19

20

21 "This transcript represents an unofficial record. Please
22 consult the accompanying video for the official record of
23 IRC proceedings."

24

25

C E R T I F I C A T E

1
2
3 STATE OF ARIZONA)
4) ss.
5 COUNTY OF MARICOPA)
6

7 BE IT KNOWN that the foregoing proceedings were
8 taken before me, Angela Furniss Miller, Certified Reporter
9 No. 50127, all done to the best of my skill and ability;
that the proceedings were taken down by me in shorthand and
thereafter reduced to print under my direction.

10 I CERTIFY that I am in no way related to any of the
11 parties hereto nor am I in any way interested in the outcome
thereof.

12 I FURTHER CERTIFY that I have complied with the
13 requirements set forth in ACJA 7-206. Dated at Litchfield
Park, Arizona, this 15th of December, 2021.

14
15 

Angela Furniss Miller, RPR, CR
16 CERTIFIED REPORTER (AZ50127)

17 * * *

18 I CERTIFY that Miller Certified Reporting, LLC, has
19 complied with the requirements set forth in ACJA 7-201 and
20 7-206. Dated at LITCHFIELD PARK, Arizona, this 15th of
December, 2021.

21  *type text here*

Miller Certified Reporting, LLC
22 Arizona RRF No. R1058
23
24
25

Miller Certified Reporting, LLC